



NOT SANDBAGGED

PATRICIA CHURCHLAND PART 2

DR. DAVID LANE

skeptiko.com

1
00:00:17,390 --> 00:00:14,760
on this episode of skeptic Oh Alex talks

2
00:00:19,980 --> 00:00:17,400
with dr. David C Lane about cults

3
00:00:21,150 --> 00:00:19,990
skepticism and his defense of dr.

4
00:00:23,970 --> 00:00:21,160
Patricia Churchland

5
00:00:27,510 --> 00:00:23,980
I'm having an interview with her to

6
00:00:29,670 --> 00:00:27,520
expose how ridiculous it is for this

7
00:00:31,890 --> 00:00:29,680
person to be writing books on

8
00:00:35,190 --> 00:00:31,900
consciousness to be teaching our

9
00:00:38,820 --> 00:00:35,200
children these ridiculous ideas that she

10
00:00:41,520 --> 00:00:38,830
can't defend in even the most basic way

11
00:00:43,680 --> 00:00:41,530
when I go to the dentist do I want him

12
00:00:45,990 --> 00:00:43,690
to think that the pain that I have from

13
00:00:47,850 --> 00:00:46,000

my wisdom tooth is part and parcel of my

14

00:00:50,219 --> 00:00:47,860

brain let's say or part of my peripheral

15

00:00:54,479 --> 00:00:50,229

nervous system the answer is yes so on

16

00:00:56,670 --> 00:00:54,489

one level if we are matter what is the

17

00:00:58,860 --> 00:00:56,680

matter my point being is what's the

18

00:01:01,140 --> 00:00:58,870

problem if we are just the brain because

19

00:01:03,600 --> 00:01:01,150

physics itself like matter itself is

20

00:01:07,649 --> 00:01:03,610

more mysterious in a weird way the

21

00:01:18,289 --> 00:01:07,659

spirit even describes stay with us for

22

00:01:22,170 --> 00:01:20,580

welcome to skeptic Oh where we explore

23

00:01:24,359 --> 00:01:22,180

controversial science with leading

24

00:01:26,429 --> 00:01:24,369

researchers thinkers and their critics

25

00:01:29,120 --> 00:01:26,439

I'm your host Alex Karras and on this

26
00:01:33,359 --> 00:01:29,130
episode a show that's really more about

27
00:01:34,980 --> 00:01:33,369
process than it is about content if you

28
00:01:38,309 --> 00:01:34,990
will not that our guest doesn't have a

29
00:01:41,160 --> 00:01:38,319
lot of interesting ideas and content to

30
00:01:43,679 --> 00:01:41,170
say he certainly does but I think what

31
00:01:47,039 --> 00:01:43,689
this interview is really about is the

32
00:01:49,289 --> 00:01:47,049
process by which we go about debating

33
00:01:51,570 --> 00:01:49,299
the topics that we talk about here on

34
00:01:54,330 --> 00:01:51,580
skeptic oh now a few episodes back I

35
00:01:58,859 --> 00:01:54,340
published my interview with dr. Patricia

36
00:02:00,480 --> 00:01:58,869
Churchland a philosopher a professor of

37
00:02:03,210 --> 00:02:00,490
philosophy at University of California

38
00:02:05,460 --> 00:02:03,220

San Diego a well-known figure in the

39

00:02:07,649 --> 00:02:05,470

consciousness community also someone

40

00:02:10,229 --> 00:02:07,659

that skeptics and atheists like to point

41

00:02:12,780 --> 00:02:10,239

to as a credible academic that supports

42

00:02:15,210 --> 00:02:12,790

their position that interview created

43

00:02:18,180 --> 00:02:15,220

quite a stir because of dr. Churchland

44

00:02:21,569 --> 00:02:18,190

performance in her inability to examine

45

00:02:23,610 --> 00:02:21,579

really any challenge to her ideas now

46

00:02:26,729 --> 00:02:23,620

today's interview is quite different

47

00:02:29,129 --> 00:02:26,739

than that dr. David Lane as you'll hear

48

00:02:31,530 --> 00:02:29,139

was initially supportive of dr.

49

00:02:34,319 --> 00:02:31,540

Churchland position but in this

50

00:02:37,319 --> 00:02:34,329

interview you'll hear from someone who

51

00:02:40,199 --> 00:02:37,329

is truly open to examining and

52

00:02:42,120 --> 00:02:40,209

re-examining the data based on the best

53

00:02:44,220 --> 00:02:42,130

evidence that he can get his hands on

54

00:02:46,620 --> 00:02:44,230

it's refreshing to hear it's an

55

00:02:49,590 --> 00:02:46,630

interview I enjoy doing and I hope you

56

00:02:53,280 --> 00:02:49,600

enjoy listening to it today we welcome

57

00:02:55,800 --> 00:02:53,290

dr. David C Lane to skeptic Oh dr. lane

58

00:02:58,470 --> 00:02:55,810

is professor of philosophy at Mount San

59

00:03:00,750 --> 00:02:58,480

Antonio College in the LA area and a

60

00:03:04,050 --> 00:03:00,760

lecturer and religious studies at Cal

61

00:03:06,960 --> 00:03:04,060

State Long Beach he hosts the neural

62

00:03:09,420 --> 00:03:06,970

surfer website a site that has a tag

63

00:03:13,470 --> 00:03:09,430

line where The Skeptical meets the

64

00:03:16,650 --> 00:03:13,480

mystical we're gonna have to ask and

65

00:03:19,199 --> 00:03:16,660

he's done some amazing work exposing

66

00:03:21,690 --> 00:03:19,209

new-age cults I mean the kind of work

67

00:03:23,159 --> 00:03:21,700

that made him a target for those groups

68

00:03:25,890 --> 00:03:23,169

where he's getting death threats at

69

00:03:27,839 --> 00:03:25,900

night so this is another interesting

70

00:03:31,070 --> 00:03:27,849

thing we can talk about and then the

71

00:03:34,430 --> 00:03:31,080

real main reason I wanted to have

72

00:03:37,250 --> 00:03:34,440

Avon is because he recently posted an

73

00:03:39,640 --> 00:03:37,260

essay defending his friend dr. Patricia

74

00:03:42,050 --> 00:03:39,650

Churchland who as many of you know

75

00:03:45,110 --> 00:03:42,060

appeared on skeptic Oh a few episodes

76

00:03:48,020 --> 00:03:45,120

ago and had some interesting things to

77

00:03:51,590 --> 00:03:48,030

say about near-death experience science

78

00:03:53,480 --> 00:03:51,600

so we have a lot to talk about I think

79

00:03:55,550 --> 00:03:53,490

it ought to be really fun and

80

00:03:58,070 --> 00:03:55,560

interesting I've had a nice email

81

00:04:00,680 --> 00:03:58,080

exchange with dr. Lane he seems like a

82

00:04:02,120 --> 00:04:00,690

really nice guy who I'd like but we're

83

00:04:04,790 --> 00:04:02,130

probably gonna butt heads and some

84

00:04:07,490 --> 00:04:04,800

buddies as well I first want to start

85

00:04:09,170 --> 00:04:07,500

just by thanking you Dave so much for

86

00:04:10,970 --> 00:04:09,180

joining me and coming on skeptic oh oh

87

00:04:12,560 --> 00:04:10,980

face you don't also thanks for reading

88

00:04:15,140 --> 00:04:12,570

the article because it's always kind of

89

00:04:18,380 --> 00:04:15,150

nice to get feedback so I appreciate you

90

00:04:20,900 --> 00:04:18,390

doing that absolutely that's I I love

91

00:04:22,400 --> 00:04:20,910

the the Internet in the community that

92

00:04:25,070 --> 00:04:22,410

we create and being able to link up with

93

00:04:27,260 --> 00:04:25,080

people that you didn't know and suddenly

94

00:04:29,300 --> 00:04:27,270

you're reading each other stuff and

95

00:04:32,140 --> 00:04:29,310

getting into each other's world a little

96

00:04:34,760 --> 00:04:32,150

bit it's a wonderful world we live in

97

00:04:37,070 --> 00:04:34,770

let's start with this why don't you fill

98

00:04:39,260 --> 00:04:37,080

in some of the details of your bio that

99

00:04:41,450 --> 00:04:39,270

I just sketched out and kind of flush

100

00:04:42,830 --> 00:04:41,460

that out for people a little bit well

101

00:04:45,620 --> 00:04:42,840

I've been a professor of philosophy at

102

00:04:48,200 --> 00:04:45,630

Mount San Antonio College for about 25 I

103

00:04:50,240 --> 00:04:48,210

may be going for my 26 year prior to

104

00:04:51,409 --> 00:04:50,250

that I used to teach at the University

105

00:04:53,390 --> 00:04:51,419

of California at San Diego

106

00:04:55,310 --> 00:04:53,400

in Warren college yeah there's number of

107

00:04:57,940 --> 00:04:55,320

colleges at UCSD I was in Warren College

108

00:05:00,650 --> 00:04:57,950

I was teaching writing English 1a 1b and

109

00:05:02,600 --> 00:05:00,660

at the time I was giving my PhD in the

110

00:05:03,890 --> 00:05:02,610

sociology of knowledge and my interest

111

00:05:05,960 --> 00:05:03,900

has always been interested ly enough

112

00:05:08,659 --> 00:05:05,970

he's been Indian philosophy or Indian

113

00:05:09,920 --> 00:05:08,669

religions and so after that I had a

114

00:05:10,730 --> 00:05:09,930

number of teaching jobs I talked to the

115

00:05:13,909 --> 00:05:10,740

California School of Professional

116

00:05:17,300 --> 00:05:13,919

Psychology Palomar College and also at

117

00:05:18,890 --> 00:05:17,310

Cal State Long Beach I also you made me

118

00:05:20,240 --> 00:05:18,900

remember this in Del Mar perhaps not

119

00:05:22,070 --> 00:05:20,250

about 20 years ago there used to be a

120

00:05:24,140 --> 00:05:22,080

little kind of a funky school called the

121

00:05:26,320 --> 00:05:24,150

University University of humanistic

122

00:05:28,250 --> 00:05:26,330

studies which was really about

123

00:05:30,710 --> 00:05:28,260

parapsychology about the paranormal and

124

00:05:32,510 --> 00:05:30,720

people got their mas or PhDs there and I

125

00:05:34,730 --> 00:05:32,520

taught there in the latter part of the I

126

00:05:37,969 --> 00:05:34,740

think was a late 80s early part of the

127

00:05:39,830 --> 00:05:37,979

1990s and my wife Andrea is also a

128

00:05:43,070 --> 00:05:39,840

professor of philosophy she got her PhD

129

00:05:44,540 --> 00:05:43,080

at UC Santa Barbara although she did our

130

00:05:44,989 --> 00:05:44,550

undergraduate you'll find this

131

00:05:46,639 --> 00:05:44,999

interesting

132

00:05:49,309 --> 00:05:46,649

a UCSD and it used to be a research

133

00:05:53,539 --> 00:05:49,319

assistant 2 vs Ramachandran you know the

134

00:05:56,299 --> 00:05:53,549

very famous neuroscientist so Wow quite

135

00:05:57,439 --> 00:05:56,309

a lot of brainpower in that family yeah

136

00:06:00,799 --> 00:05:57,449

what definitely my wife's definitely

137

00:06:06,319 --> 00:06:00,809

smarter than I well played well played

138

00:06:09,079 --> 00:06:06,329

weather yeah so tell us a little bit

139

00:06:12,679 --> 00:06:09,089

about I love this tag line where The

140

00:06:14,749 --> 00:06:12,689

Skeptical meets the mystical well you

141

00:06:16,100 --> 00:06:14,759

know for it from when I was young about

142

00:06:18,409 --> 00:06:16,110

10 or 11 years old

143

00:06:19,879 --> 00:06:18,419

I was really into baseball and it must

144

00:06:21,350 --> 00:06:19,889

have been in the early 1960s and I

145

00:06:23,569 --> 00:06:21,360

walked into the North Hollywood Public

146

00:06:25,669 --> 00:06:23,579

Library and I saw one that will read

147

00:06:27,199 --> 00:06:25,679

about Yogi Berra now show you how stupid

148

00:06:29,689 --> 00:06:27,209

I was I saw this book called

149

00:06:30,769 --> 00:06:29,699

autobiography of a yogi' well and I

150

00:06:32,209 --> 00:06:30,779

thought well made this about Yogi Berra

151
00:06:34,759 --> 00:06:32,219
thought I saw the cover of course and

152
00:06:37,569 --> 00:06:34,769
it's about Yogananda sort of very young

153
00:06:39,439 --> 00:06:37,579
age I got interested in alternative

154
00:06:41,839 --> 00:06:39,449
spirituality different than the Roman

155
00:06:44,359 --> 00:06:41,849
Catholic faith I was brought up into so

156
00:06:46,519 --> 00:06:44,369
I read that book when I was 11 and I got

157
00:06:48,049 --> 00:06:46,529
very interested on a spiritual quest so

158
00:06:49,939 --> 00:06:48,059
I read every single thing I could

159
00:06:51,619 --> 00:06:49,949
possibly read from in high school

160
00:06:53,659 --> 00:06:51,629
whatever and then eventually what

161
00:06:55,519 --> 00:06:53,669
happened was I spoke in tongues of all

162
00:06:57,619 --> 00:06:55,529
things glossolalia when I was 15 years

163
00:07:00,019 --> 00:06:57,629

old and it was such a transformative

164

00:07:02,449 --> 00:07:00,029

experience that it kind of opened my

165

00:07:04,249 --> 00:07:02,459

eyes up to alternative realities even if

166

00:07:06,139 --> 00:07:04,259

I have a different you know neurological

167

00:07:08,449 --> 00:07:06,149

explanation speaking in tongues later at

168

00:07:10,909 --> 00:07:08,459

the time that was very mystical so I

169

00:07:13,369 --> 00:07:10,919

think eventually get interested in India

170

00:07:16,129 --> 00:07:13,379

I go on a research project at the age of

171

00:07:19,129 --> 00:07:16,139

22 with Professor Jergens mine out of

172

00:07:21,289 --> 00:07:19,139

Berkeley to go study North Indian gurus

173

00:07:22,819 --> 00:07:21,299

and my job because I was pretty good at

174

00:07:24,350 --> 00:07:22,829

baseball cards I just transferred it

175

00:07:28,100 --> 00:07:24,360

over to guru cards if you get my drift

176
00:07:30,439 --> 00:07:28,110
here and I developed a huge genealogical

177
00:07:32,359 --> 00:07:30,449
tree of these gurus who practice

178
00:07:34,309 --> 00:07:32,369
literally conscious near-death

179
00:07:36,709 --> 00:07:34,319
experiences so they do a technique

180
00:07:39,109 --> 00:07:36,719
called Shabet yoga so I had to go track

181
00:07:41,749 --> 00:07:39,119
these guys down interview them it's

182
00:07:43,879 --> 00:07:41,759
fascinating stuff but right prior to

183
00:07:46,309 --> 00:07:43,889
doing that in my undergraduate days at

184
00:07:48,109 --> 00:07:46,319
Cal State Northridge I did a term paper

185
00:07:49,609 --> 00:07:48,119
and you may have known about this about

186
00:07:52,369 --> 00:07:49,619
Eckankar which is a group founded by

187
00:07:54,769 --> 00:07:52,379
Paul Twitchell back in 1965 so this is

188
00:07:56,869 --> 00:07:54,779

how old are you now David and your way

189

00:07:58,399 --> 00:07:56,879

out good student what happened is yeah

190

00:08:01,129 --> 00:07:58,409

I'm a great when I did that paper

191

00:08:03,409 --> 00:08:01,139

on Eckankar 20 let's say by the time I'm

192

00:08:05,419 --> 00:08:03,419

22 I've been invited to go to India I

193

00:08:06,979 --> 00:08:05,429

then go into Berkeley to get my master's

194

00:08:08,749 --> 00:08:06,989

degree under Jirga smart at the Graduate

195

00:08:11,089 --> 00:08:08,759

theological Union I go to India at the

196

00:08:14,119 --> 00:08:11,099

age of 22 it's what happens so I'm

197

00:08:16,850 --> 00:08:14,129

really interested in spirituality really

198

00:08:19,699 --> 00:08:16,860

interested in this kind of stuff but and

199

00:08:22,219 --> 00:08:19,709

you can imagine it's a good analogy or

200

00:08:24,109 --> 00:08:22,229

metaphor is The Wizard of Oz you know

201
00:08:25,820 --> 00:08:24,119
you really believe the wizard you really

202
00:08:27,290 --> 00:08:25,830
think he has the power and then all of a

203
00:08:29,929 --> 00:08:27,300
sudden because you get in the inside

204
00:08:31,699 --> 00:08:29,939
glimpse you start to pull the curtain

205
00:08:34,399 --> 00:08:31,709
and you see that there's you know more

206
00:08:36,050 --> 00:08:34,409
mundane things happening and so when I

207
00:08:37,969 --> 00:08:36,060
did this guru study in India and I've

208
00:08:40,100 --> 00:08:37,979
been to India eight times I saw behind

209
00:08:42,050 --> 00:08:40,110
the curtain and I saw a lot of things

210
00:08:44,749 --> 00:08:42,060
that a lot of people didn't know so if

211
00:08:46,759 --> 00:08:44,759
you keep made me it almost it made me

212
00:08:48,470 --> 00:08:46,769
much more skeptical as the years

213
00:08:50,480 --> 00:08:48,480

progressed if that makes any sense so

214

00:08:52,309 --> 00:08:50,490

but I'm kind of a contradiction of terms

215

00:08:53,809 --> 00:08:52,319

to quote Errol Flynn who happens to be

216

00:08:55,610 --> 00:08:53,819

like one of my favorite movie stars

217

00:08:57,860 --> 00:08:55,620

wonderful book called my wicked wicked

218

00:09:00,019 --> 00:08:57,870

ways he says I'm an octagon of

219

00:09:01,730 --> 00:09:00,029

contradictions which in itself may be no

220

00:09:03,050 --> 00:09:01,740

contradiction and I kind of the same way

221

00:09:05,389 --> 00:09:03,060

because people get irritated with me

222

00:09:08,389 --> 00:09:05,399

because on one side I'm still that young

223

00:09:10,400 --> 00:09:08,399

boy who's seeking and in the other side

224

00:09:13,490 --> 00:09:10,410

I'm kind of that jaded skeptic who's

225

00:09:16,340 --> 00:09:13,500

seen too much very good very good so I

226

00:09:18,679 --> 00:09:16,350

kind of missed I kind of directed you

227

00:09:19,970 --> 00:09:18,689

away from this other interesting topic

228

00:09:23,179 --> 00:09:19,980

that I want you to talk about a little

229

00:09:25,610 --> 00:09:23,189

bit your book exposing cults when the

230

00:09:27,800 --> 00:09:25,620

skeptical mind confronts the mystical

231

00:09:29,629 --> 00:09:27,810

and it's quite a story right yeah

232

00:09:32,210 --> 00:09:29,639

because what happens is at the age of

233

00:09:34,040 --> 00:09:32,220

twenty I do its term paper on acting car

234

00:09:36,559 --> 00:09:34,050

and it's supposed to be ten pages but it

235

00:09:37,910 --> 00:09:36,569

balloons up to about 120 150 pages

236

00:09:40,579 --> 00:09:37,920

because I find out that Paul Twitchell

237

00:09:42,350 --> 00:09:40,589

had plagiarized his sacred writings

238

00:09:46,610 --> 00:09:42,360

let's say okay look can you back up tell

239

00:09:49,189 --> 00:09:46,620

people who he is and who he how

240

00:09:51,980 --> 00:09:49,199

prominent he still is today and yeah

241

00:09:53,299 --> 00:09:51,990

right right Paul Twitchell was used to

242

00:09:56,569 --> 00:09:53,309

it's kind of a religious secret he's

243

00:09:59,660 --> 00:09:56,579

from Paducah Kentucky he in the early

244

00:10:02,269 --> 00:09:59,670

1960s he starts his his group called

245

00:10:03,829 --> 00:10:02,279

eckankar now Eckankar is it's a Punjabi

246

00:10:05,569 --> 00:10:03,839

word which really means one guy but

247

00:10:07,429 --> 00:10:05,579

he'll change that later but he starts

248

00:10:09,079 --> 00:10:07,439

his group in the 60s where a lot of

249

00:10:10,730 --> 00:10:09,089

groups are started you know and he

250

00:10:12,320 --> 00:10:10,740

starts it actually in San Diego he then

251
00:10:14,300 --> 00:10:12,330
eventually moves it to Las Vegas

252
00:10:17,510 --> 00:10:14,310
what's the goal of the group is to have

253
00:10:19,580 --> 00:10:17,520
conscious out-of-body experiences he was

254
00:10:21,620 --> 00:10:19,590
influenced well we think he's influenced

255
00:10:23,450 --> 00:10:21,630
by four major factors he used to be a

256
00:10:25,340 --> 00:10:23,460
press agent from L ron Hubbard's and

257
00:10:26,510 --> 00:10:25,350
Scientology he was associated with

258
00:10:29,150 --> 00:10:26,520
self-realization fellowship

259
00:10:31,730 --> 00:10:29,160
Yogananda he was also a member of Kirpal

260
00:10:33,920 --> 00:10:31,740
Singh's group rou-ha-nee satsang and he

261
00:10:35,960 --> 00:10:33,930
was also connected to theosophy or at

262
00:10:38,030 --> 00:10:35,970
least influenced by theosophy so when I

263
00:10:40,310 --> 00:10:38,040

did my term paper I found out a lot of

264

00:10:42,590 --> 00:10:40,320

things that people didn't know I'm kind

265

00:10:44,690 --> 00:10:42,600

of really naive at the time so I'd do

266

00:10:46,550 --> 00:10:44,700

the term paper I sent it to eken cars

267

00:10:49,250 --> 00:10:46,560

headquarters which used to be in Menlo

268

00:10:52,190 --> 00:10:49,260

Park and twitch was now dead he died in

269

00:10:53,900 --> 00:10:52,200

1971 and so they write me back a couple

270

00:10:55,340 --> 00:10:53,910

months later my mom's kind of teary

271

00:10:57,380 --> 00:10:55,350

because she gets this registered letter

272

00:10:59,270 --> 00:10:57,390

from the San Francisco attorney saying

273

00:11:02,540 --> 00:10:59,280

they're gonna sue me because you've

274

00:11:04,310 --> 00:11:02,550

exposed just blatant plagiarism here

275

00:11:05,960 --> 00:11:04,320

that it's kind of undeniable at this

276

00:11:07,850 --> 00:11:05,970

point right you would think you would

277

00:11:09,290 --> 00:11:07,860

think so and also he'd lied about his

278

00:11:11,960 --> 00:11:09,300

life you know he claimed he was born in

279

00:11:14,210 --> 00:11:11,970

1922 he had a young wife and as far as

280

00:11:15,800 --> 00:11:14,220

we can tell he's born in 1909 he also

281

00:11:17,630 --> 00:11:15,810

claims to have traveled to India there's

282

00:11:19,160 --> 00:11:17,640

no evidence that he actually did he

283

00:11:21,380 --> 00:11:19,170

claims that he meets some represent ours

284

00:11:23,180 --> 00:11:21,390

a 500 year old Tibetan monk there's no

285

00:11:25,100 --> 00:11:23,190

evidence that exists so he's kind of

286

00:11:28,430 --> 00:11:25,110

creates a religious mythology if you get

287

00:11:31,190 --> 00:11:28,440

my drift to kind of hide his real Theo

288

00:11:33,050 --> 00:11:31,200

pannu city or his real past and so I

289

00:11:35,210 --> 00:11:33,060

tried to uncover that to show what his

290

00:11:37,520 --> 00:11:35,220

historical life was really like versus

291

00:11:39,890 --> 00:11:37,530

his mythology that he's you know created

292

00:11:42,200 --> 00:11:39,900

and because I did that Eckankar was

293

00:11:43,790 --> 00:11:42,210

really irritated and what happened is

294

00:11:46,370 --> 00:11:43,800

some guy got a hold of my term paper and

295

00:11:48,500 --> 00:11:46,380

then bicycle dit or copied it throughout

296

00:11:50,390 --> 00:11:48,510

the United States in Europe and it

297

00:11:52,130 --> 00:11:50,400

caused a huge stir and I got death

298

00:11:54,530 --> 00:11:52,140

threats and people want to kill me and

299

00:11:56,120 --> 00:11:54,540

sue me and blah blah blah so that just

300

00:11:57,710 --> 00:11:56,130

started it and then of course there's

301
00:12:01,310 --> 00:11:57,720
all these other groups that happened

302
00:12:03,800 --> 00:12:01,320
later on amazing I mean that really does

303
00:12:07,280 --> 00:12:03,810
kind of fill in the background quite a

304
00:12:10,580 --> 00:12:07,290
unique perspective you bring to this as

305
00:12:12,050 --> 00:12:10,590
you said so I don't know I we could talk

306
00:12:14,120 --> 00:12:12,060
about that for a long time I did send

307
00:12:16,730 --> 00:12:14,130
you a link to another show I've done on

308
00:12:18,860 --> 00:12:16,740
the cult phenomena I think it's it's

309
00:12:21,620 --> 00:12:18,870
fascinating and I think the intersection

310
00:12:23,860 --> 00:12:21,630
with a lot of the consciousness research

311
00:12:26,060 --> 00:12:23,870
that I've been looking at is as

312
00:12:27,920 --> 00:12:26,070
undeniable and exotic

313
00:12:30,050 --> 00:12:27,930

explored and kind of like this dark

314

00:12:32,330 --> 00:12:30,060

little alley that no one quite wants to

315

00:12:35,450 --> 00:12:32,340

go down no matter which side you're on

316

00:12:37,700 --> 00:12:35,460

but I do want to move off of that if I

317

00:12:40,970 --> 00:12:37,710

can because of course and the time we

318

00:12:44,120 --> 00:12:40,980

have I really want to focus in on this

319

00:12:48,410 --> 00:12:44,130

essay that you posted in a real-world

320

00:12:51,950 --> 00:12:48,420

jot net website right idled the material

321

00:12:55,460 --> 00:12:51,960

basis of near-death experiences and it's

322

00:12:58,070 --> 00:12:55,470

a direct kind of I don't know it's a

323

00:13:00,350 --> 00:12:58,080

summation and a rebuttal to this

324

00:13:03,470 --> 00:13:00,360

interview that I had with Patricia

325

00:13:07,010 --> 00:13:03,480

Churchland about near-death experiences

326
00:13:08,540 --> 00:13:07,020
in your understanding of how that kind

327
00:13:11,000 --> 00:13:08,550
of went off the rails or wherever it did

328
00:13:12,770 --> 00:13:11,010
tell us why you wrote it and and what

329
00:13:13,820 --> 00:13:12,780
you write think write it no that's good

330
00:13:15,920 --> 00:13:13,830
let me give you a little background

331
00:13:17,930 --> 00:13:15,930
cause it'll kind of help when I went to

332
00:13:20,300 --> 00:13:17,940
UCSD I to Regis fellowship to get my PhD

333
00:13:22,490 --> 00:13:20,310
in 84 they also gave me a teaching job I

334
00:13:24,680 --> 00:13:22,500
think at that same year if I'm not

335
00:13:26,870 --> 00:13:24,690
mistaken Patricia Churchland and Paul

336
00:13:29,210 --> 00:13:26,880
Churchland came to UCSD they were

337
00:13:30,980 --> 00:13:29,220
considered really hot professors right

338
00:13:33,560 --> 00:13:30,990

and remember I'm just in graduate school

339

00:13:34,970 --> 00:13:33,570

and trying to get my PhD well I'm

340

00:13:36,470 --> 00:13:34,980

teaching this writing class and I have a

341

00:13:38,630 --> 00:13:36,480

friend of mine who I met it was now a

342

00:13:40,400 --> 00:13:38,640

surfer I mean it was surfer then but

343

00:13:43,490 --> 00:13:40,410

he's now in Australia named Tom Wagoner

344

00:13:45,290 --> 00:13:43,500

and he was taking my class and purchased

345

00:13:48,020 --> 00:13:45,300

a church Chile's class at the same time

346

00:13:49,430 --> 00:13:48,030

and he would come in and tell me about

347

00:13:50,600 --> 00:13:49,440

her neural philosophy you know a couple

348

00:13:52,730 --> 00:13:50,610

years later she will write that very

349

00:13:54,500 --> 00:13:52,740

famous textbook called neural philosophy

350

00:13:55,940 --> 00:13:54,510

because she's basically the progenitor

351

00:13:57,230 --> 00:13:55,950

of this idea that you can't do

352

00:13:59,570 --> 00:13:57,240

philosophy without studying the brain

353

00:14:01,600 --> 00:13:59,580

well watch where I'm coming from I'm

354

00:14:04,190 --> 00:14:01,610

coming from like a ramana maharshi

355

00:14:05,840 --> 00:14:04,200

consciousness first principle that you

356

00:14:08,090 --> 00:14:05,850

can't understand consciousness without

357

00:14:09,320 --> 00:14:08,100

being conscious if you get my drift you

358

00:14:11,390 --> 00:14:09,330

have to it's almost John Searles notion

359

00:14:13,970 --> 00:14:11,400

that you have to do first-person

360

00:14:16,730 --> 00:14:13,980

subjectivity and a third-person analysis

361

00:14:18,230 --> 00:14:16,740

will just not capture it so he comes in

362

00:14:19,940 --> 00:14:18,240

tells me that Churchland says you're

363

00:14:21,920 --> 00:14:19,950

just three pounds of glorious wonder me

364

00:14:24,350 --> 00:14:21,930

you're just the brain and I'm an

365

00:14:26,840 --> 00:14:24,360

arrogant sob at the time that's [\h__\h]

366

00:14:28,820 --> 00:14:26,850

you go tell her this so I tell her the

367

00:14:29,930 --> 00:14:28,830

Ramana Maharshi idea but you know who's

368

00:14:31,670 --> 00:14:29,940

asking the question where's

369

00:14:33,410 --> 00:14:31,680

consciousness and all that and he would

370

00:14:35,660 --> 00:14:33,420

come back and I don't know if he told

371

00:14:37,100 --> 00:14:35,670

Churchill and who I was I just I would

372

00:14:38,840 --> 00:14:37,110

imagine he didn't he would probably just

373

00:14:39,950 --> 00:14:38,850

raised his hand and said I got some some

374

00:14:41,390 --> 00:14:39,960

nutty English teacher

375

00:14:43,670 --> 00:14:41,400

is telling me that there's something

376

00:14:46,370 --> 00:14:43,680

more beyond the brain and she would just

377

00:14:47,750 --> 00:14:46,380

lacerate my response now if this would

378

00:14:50,270 --> 00:14:47,760

go back and forth during the whole

379

00:14:52,550 --> 00:14:50,280

quarter at UCSD so I was I knew about

380

00:14:54,590 --> 00:14:52,560

her work and so I was fascinated and I

381

00:14:57,560 --> 00:14:54,600

had this kind of perverse mentality of

382

00:14:59,900 --> 00:14:57,570

wanting to understand the opposite of

383

00:15:01,580 --> 00:14:59,910

what I believe so when she came out with

384

00:15:02,480 --> 00:15:01,590

neural philosophy and Paul Churchill II

385

00:15:04,580 --> 00:15:02,490

came out with matter and consciousness

386

00:15:05,990 --> 00:15:04,590

and the engine the see the soul and all

387

00:15:09,080 --> 00:15:06,000

that I just became obsessed about

388

00:15:10,730 --> 00:15:09,090

reading their books so in 1990 and this

389

00:15:14,750 --> 00:15:10,740

will all set up why I responded the way

390

00:15:16,370 --> 00:15:14,760

I did in 1990 a student of mine Meredith

391

00:15:18,170 --> 00:15:16,380

Doran she's now a professor I think of

392

00:15:20,210 --> 00:15:18,180

French literature at Penn State real

393

00:15:22,820 --> 00:15:20,220

bright student and interested in

394

00:15:23,720 --> 00:15:22,830

spiritual realities wanted to interview

395

00:15:25,360 --> 00:15:23,730

because we're doing a thing called

396

00:15:27,710 --> 00:15:25,370

Plato's cave which is a journal on

397

00:15:29,360 --> 00:15:27,720

philosophers she wanted to interview a

398

00:15:31,700 --> 00:15:29,370

female philosopher and as you know

399

00:15:34,430 --> 00:15:31,710

they're relatively rare I mean famous

400

00:15:35,120 --> 00:15:34,440

ones so I said hey interview Patricia

401
00:15:37,340 --> 00:15:35,130
Churchland

402
00:15:38,540 --> 00:15:37,350
so she calls her in the fall they have a

403
00:15:40,700 --> 00:15:38,550
long interview it's published I think

404
00:15:42,880 --> 00:15:40,710
it's on intricate world as well it was

405
00:15:44,840 --> 00:15:42,890
called the neural basis of consciousness

406
00:15:47,420 --> 00:15:44,850
glorious piece of meat the Dalai Lama

407
00:15:48,410 --> 00:15:47,430
and she does a really nice interview

408
00:15:49,760 --> 00:15:48,420
because you know as Churchill it's a

409
00:15:51,980 --> 00:15:49,770
hardcore materialist and she takes

410
00:15:53,990 --> 00:15:51,990
eliminative materialism reduces it down

411
00:15:55,910 --> 00:15:54,000
to the brain so we published that and I

412
00:15:57,800 --> 00:15:55,920
thought it's a good interview so what

413
00:16:00,230 --> 00:15:57,810

happens is I become kind of a churchand

414

00:16:03,230 --> 00:16:00,240

aficionado because I study all her stuff

415

00:16:04,640 --> 00:16:03,240

and read her blogs and all that so about

416

00:16:05,900 --> 00:16:04,650

must one's to two weeks ago when your

417

00:16:08,090 --> 00:16:05,910

interview came when did you interview

418

00:16:10,850 --> 00:16:08,100

come out and the end of January

419

00:16:12,860 --> 00:16:10,860

beginning of February 2014 fair enough I

420

00:16:14,600 --> 00:16:12,870

hadn't even heard of it but what

421

00:16:16,760 --> 00:16:14,610

happened is I started getting flooded

422

00:16:19,550 --> 00:16:16,770

with people tell me about this interview

423

00:16:21,200 --> 00:16:19,560

and people irritated at me because I had

424

00:16:22,790 --> 00:16:21,210

quoted Churchland you know I've made a

425

00:16:25,010 --> 00:16:22,800

couple movies related to her philosophy

426

00:16:26,600 --> 00:16:25,020

and one guy in particular I think those

427

00:16:28,370 --> 00:16:26,610

guys from Germany goes you should never

428

00:16:30,050 --> 00:16:28,380

court Churchill and again read this

429

00:16:31,610 --> 00:16:30,060

interviewing and then I got somebody on

430

00:16:34,190 --> 00:16:31,620

radhaswami studies which is a yahoo

431

00:16:36,470 --> 00:16:34,200

forum that we do and a good guy a guy

432

00:16:37,940 --> 00:16:36,480

highly respect man jet is his username

433

00:16:40,460 --> 00:16:37,950

he says you've got to check this thing

434

00:16:42,530 --> 00:16:40,470

out so I looked at the interview and I

435

00:16:44,270 --> 00:16:42,540

said oh wow and I think when you first

436

00:16:46,430 --> 00:16:44,280

posted the interview the transcript

437

00:16:49,040 --> 00:16:46,440

wasn't fully there if I'm not mistaken

438

00:16:50,690 --> 00:16:49,050

or maybe it was but I wanted to listen

439

00:16:52,160 --> 00:16:50,700

to the interview so I did that and then

440

00:16:53,480 --> 00:16:52,170

I got kind of excited though this isn't

441

00:16:56,180 --> 00:16:53,490

the interesting thing

442

00:17:01,130 --> 00:16:56,190

but then I realized I better go read pin

443

00:17:03,800 --> 00:17:01,140

is a pin Van LOM all lamang seven van

444

00:17:05,299 --> 00:17:03,810

llama llama Kayla llama I said I gotta

445

00:17:07,579 --> 00:17:05,309

go read his original study cuz that's

446

00:17:09,710 --> 00:17:07,589

what she quotes in Lancet so I did that

447

00:17:11,240 --> 00:17:09,720

and then I analyzed it I said what

448

00:17:13,939 --> 00:17:11,250

really goes on here was she really

449

00:17:15,620 --> 00:17:13,949

scared of Alex which I can't imagine she

450

00:17:18,500 --> 00:17:15,630

would because she would have to expect

451
00:17:20,870 --> 00:17:18,510
right that people are gonna be doubtful

452
00:17:22,189 --> 00:17:20,880
that were just the brain that Indies are

453
00:17:23,720 --> 00:17:22,199
just the brain so I did that my little

454
00:17:25,809 --> 00:17:23,730
analysis that was the reason I did it I

455
00:17:28,189 --> 00:17:25,819
got kind of excited that was fun

456
00:17:30,770 --> 00:17:28,199
awesome like I said at the beginning I

457
00:17:32,180 --> 00:17:30,780
mean the opportunity to engage a guy

458
00:17:34,580 --> 00:17:32,190
like you and me Cheers

459
00:17:36,770 --> 00:17:34,590
is super so whatever comes out of it I'm

460
00:17:38,570 --> 00:17:36,780
already for the better but I want to dig

461
00:17:40,669 --> 00:17:38,580
into that and I think we can have a real

462
00:17:41,630 --> 00:17:40,679
productive interesting discussion about

463
00:17:43,870 --> 00:17:41,640

what you've written

464

00:17:47,180 --> 00:17:43,880

okay Leon in the essay you write this

465

00:17:49,160 --> 00:17:47,190

church lence materialistic view that

466

00:17:51,860 --> 00:17:49,170

consciousness is a product of the brain

467

00:17:55,040 --> 00:17:51,870

was touching a very sensitive nerve

468

00:17:57,680 --> 00:17:55,050

affects those who hold the consciousness

469

00:18:00,080 --> 00:17:57,690

cannot be materially reduced to the

470

00:18:03,049 --> 00:18:00,090

substratum of our central nervous system

471

00:18:05,720 --> 00:18:03,059

now I find this fascinating because I

472

00:18:09,620 --> 00:18:05,730

hear this kind of thing sometimes and it

473

00:18:13,040 --> 00:18:09,630

seems to me like a very strange grief

474

00:18:16,070 --> 00:18:13,050

formulation of the issue I mean I think

475

00:18:18,590 --> 00:18:16,080

we all understand what is at stake here

476
00:18:20,690 --> 00:18:18,600
near-death experiences seeming to be

477
00:18:22,160 --> 00:18:20,700
evidence that consciousness is not a

478
00:18:24,410 --> 00:18:22,170
product of the brain I mean that's

479
00:18:26,450 --> 00:18:24,420
what's on the table so it's a really big

480
00:18:28,940 --> 00:18:26,460
deal it would not only totally

481
00:18:32,240 --> 00:18:28,950
revolutionize philosophy but science

482
00:18:34,880 --> 00:18:32,250
Western thought in its entirety would be

483
00:18:37,640 --> 00:18:34,890
shaken up if that was true so it's not

484
00:18:39,740 --> 00:18:37,650
our matter of touching a nerve it's

485
00:18:42,080 --> 00:18:39,750
about trying to answer one of the most

486
00:18:45,260 --> 00:18:42,090
important scientific questions we could

487
00:18:48,680 --> 00:18:45,270
answer and the problem with the

488
00:18:51,620 --> 00:18:48,690

interview is that Churchland is such a

489

00:18:53,870 --> 00:18:51,630

total lightweight when it comes to

490

00:18:55,790 --> 00:18:53,880

near-death experience research I mean

491

00:18:59,000 --> 00:18:55,800

she's just over her head from the

492

00:19:00,950 --> 00:18:59,010

beginning now Dave you're kind of open

493

00:19:02,570 --> 00:19:00,960

enough to admit that you don't even

494

00:19:05,810 --> 00:19:02,580

can't even pronounce

495

00:19:07,220 --> 00:19:05,820

dr. pin van llamas name right right he

496

00:19:09,169 --> 00:19:07,230

is quoting him

497

00:19:11,480 --> 00:19:09,179

and doesn't know his work doesn't

498

00:19:14,360 --> 00:19:11,490

understand his work doesn't understand

499

00:19:17,900 --> 00:19:14,370

near-death experience science and the

500

00:19:19,700 --> 00:19:17,910

published research in general so I see

501
00:19:22,159 --> 00:19:19,710
somebody likes to come on strong with

502
00:19:23,210 --> 00:19:22,169
these ideas but as soon as you push back

503
00:19:25,250 --> 00:19:23,220
a little bit

504
00:19:27,260 --> 00:19:25,260
she just looks rather ridiculous and I

505
00:19:30,260 --> 00:19:27,270
think that's what happened but the way I

506
00:19:32,150 --> 00:19:30,270
look at it alex is I concede you're

507
00:19:34,060 --> 00:19:32,160
totally correct that I don't think she

508
00:19:36,020 --> 00:19:34,070
has a wide range of materials

509
00:19:37,940 --> 00:19:36,030
understanding indies i think that's

510
00:19:39,919 --> 00:19:37,950
obvious because for instance just this

511
00:19:43,789 --> 00:19:39,929
morning i watched one of the interviews

512
00:19:45,560 --> 00:19:43,799
with vent lamang and I was fascinated

513
00:19:48,020 --> 00:19:45,570

because it was wonderful interview and

514

00:19:48,919 --> 00:19:48,030

he's very clear that he believes that

515

00:19:51,110 --> 00:19:48,929

NDEs

516

00:19:52,520 --> 00:19:51,120

are trance neuronal he does not believe

517

00:19:53,659 --> 00:19:52,530

that they're part and parcel of the

518

00:19:57,620 --> 00:19:53,669

brain you're absolutely correct on that

519

00:20:00,289 --> 00:19:57,630

however looking at Churchill ins book as

520

00:20:03,650 --> 00:20:00,299

I had read touching the nerve I noticed

521

00:20:06,020 --> 00:20:03,660

that she only cites one study by him and

522

00:20:09,110 --> 00:20:06,030

his colleagues as you know and that's in

523

00:20:11,870 --> 00:20:09,120

Lancet if you look peer lis at The

524

00:20:13,789 --> 00:20:11,880

Lancet study you can see where she's

525

00:20:16,280 --> 00:20:13,799

going I'm not Nautilus I'm not trying to

526

00:20:17,799 --> 00:20:16,290

justify her you can't justify it it's

527

00:20:20,900 --> 00:20:17,809

it's come on I mean let's be

528

00:20:23,150 --> 00:20:20,910

intellectually honest I mean that is the

529

00:20:25,310 --> 00:20:23,160

problem let me back up and fill in the

530

00:20:26,510 --> 00:20:25,320

details there for you for our listeners

531

00:20:28,580 --> 00:20:26,520

because you've already gone down this

532

00:20:32,090 --> 00:20:28,590

path and for those who don't know this

533

00:20:34,880 --> 00:20:32,100

guy dr. PIM van Lommel is very highly

534

00:20:37,100 --> 00:20:34,890

regarded cardiologist in the Netherlands

535

00:20:39,890 --> 00:20:37,110

who really kind of stumbled across this

536

00:20:41,659 --> 00:20:39,900

near-death experience stuff early in his

537

00:20:43,490 --> 00:20:41,669

professional career and has he said

538

00:20:45,919 --> 00:20:43,500

since then is that many many

539

00:20:47,330 --> 00:20:45,929

cardiologists stumble across this you

540

00:20:49,280 --> 00:20:47,340

have people who have a heart attack and

541

00:20:51,110 --> 00:20:49,290

they wake up the next day and they say

542

00:20:53,060 --> 00:20:51,120

doc you won't believe what I saw I was

543

00:20:54,230 --> 00:20:53,070

over the bed and you were resuscitating

544

00:20:56,299 --> 00:20:54,240

me and then I went and they tell the

545

00:20:58,880 --> 00:20:56,309

whole story and that happens a lot but

546

00:21:01,730 --> 00:20:58,890

this is a guy who for whatever reason

547

00:21:04,010 --> 00:21:01,740

just became you can relate to this

548

00:21:05,870 --> 00:21:04,020

basically your story he just became

549

00:21:08,530 --> 00:21:05,880

fascinated with this and he said wait a

550

00:21:10,549 --> 00:21:08,540

minute we got this is potentially

551
00:21:12,380 --> 00:21:10,559
earth-shattering we got to dig into this

552
00:21:15,440 --> 00:21:12,390
and he started studying it very

553
00:21:17,419 --> 00:21:15,450
comprehensively 20 years at a variety at

554
00:21:19,610 --> 00:21:17,429
a bunch of hospitals that he linked

555
00:21:21,080 --> 00:21:19,620
together across the Netherlands and then

556
00:21:24,200 --> 00:21:21,090
as you alluded to

557
00:21:26,030 --> 00:21:24,210
published this groundbreaking study in

558
00:21:28,580 --> 00:21:26,040
The Lancet one of the most respected

559
00:21:30,760 --> 00:21:28,590
medical journals in the world and he

560
00:21:33,650 --> 00:21:30,770
concluded and he said it in very kind of

561
00:21:35,930 --> 00:21:33,660
proper scientific terms but he basically

562
00:21:38,090 --> 00:21:35,940
said hey everything I've seen about

563
00:21:40,160 --> 00:21:38,100

near-death experiences says that they're

564

00:21:43,490 --> 00:21:40,170

highly suggestive that consciousness is

565

00:21:45,680 --> 00:21:43,500

not purely a function of the brain but

566

00:21:47,900 --> 00:21:45,690

here's the point that I guess you were

567

00:21:49,850 --> 00:21:47,910

kind of alluding to and I feel like

568

00:21:51,830 --> 00:21:49,860

we're kind of apologizing for Churchland

569

00:21:55,550 --> 00:21:51,840

in a way that we just can't do and

570

00:21:58,550 --> 00:21:55,560

that's that if you're going to engage in

571

00:22:02,180 --> 00:21:58,560

the near-death experience science you

572

00:22:05,060 --> 00:22:02,190

have to know that you can't say oh I

573

00:22:07,940 --> 00:22:05,070

picked a little phrase out of his Lancet

574

00:22:09,980 --> 00:22:07,950

study when the guy has written all these

575

00:22:12,650 --> 00:22:09,990

books as you just said has all these

576

00:22:15,380 --> 00:22:12,660

google videos you can watch is clearly

577

00:22:18,080 --> 00:22:15,390

in this camp is good not in this camp

578

00:22:20,120 --> 00:22:18,090

here's a guy studied it for 20 years as

579

00:22:21,710 --> 00:22:20,130

a professional and said this is the only

580

00:22:23,630 --> 00:22:21,720

conclusion that's reasonable to come to

581

00:22:26,030 --> 00:22:23,640

sorry end of story

582

00:22:28,910 --> 00:22:26,040

you can't get this wrong if you're

583

00:22:31,850 --> 00:22:28,920

Patricia Churchland and you claim to be

584

00:22:33,950 --> 00:22:31,860

saying anything meaningful about

585

00:22:36,320 --> 00:22:33,960

near-death experiences you can't blow it

586

00:22:37,190 --> 00:22:36,330

like she did well see the way watch

587

00:22:38,990 --> 00:22:37,200

where I'm coming from

588

00:22:41,000 --> 00:22:39,000

I'm not like watch how I was looking at

589

00:22:43,190 --> 00:22:41,010

this just so you understand I was trying

590

00:22:44,870 --> 00:22:43,200

to look at what Churchill was doing so

591

00:22:46,880 --> 00:22:44,880

what I did is that with it the lancets

592

00:22:48,080 --> 00:22:46,890

study and they go how in the hell could

593

00:22:50,450 --> 00:22:48,090

she have come up with this quote

594

00:22:52,430 --> 00:22:50,460

remember she makes this argument that's

595

00:22:55,190 --> 00:22:52,440

the contentious quote about there's a

596

00:22:57,380 --> 00:22:55,200

neurological basis to end e's and when i

597

00:23:00,410 --> 00:22:57,390

read this study you'll see where she did

598

00:23:02,090 --> 00:23:00,420

the page before she takes his study

599

00:23:03,410 --> 00:23:02,100

almost work by word remember if you

600

00:23:06,230 --> 00:23:03,420

looked at the page i think it's on page

601
00:23:08,720 --> 00:23:06,240
70 she takes almost word by word the

602
00:23:10,760 --> 00:23:08,730
summation of the guys study she then

603
00:23:13,640 --> 00:23:10,770
says and this is the contentious line

604
00:23:16,160 --> 00:23:13,650
and The Lancet study says and yet neuro

605
00:23:18,470 --> 00:23:16,170
physiological processes must play some

606
00:23:20,720 --> 00:23:18,480
part in and EE so this is where I think

607
00:23:22,550 --> 00:23:20,730
if she only looked at The Lancet study

608
00:23:24,530 --> 00:23:22,560
what happens is she then

609
00:23:26,630 --> 00:23:24,540
over-exaggerates from that sentence

610
00:23:29,360 --> 00:23:26,640
that's where you and I agree where I

611
00:23:31,280 --> 00:23:29,370
disagree is I think she just looked at

612
00:23:32,300 --> 00:23:31,290
The Lancet study do you understand what

613
00:23:34,670 --> 00:23:32,310

I'm trying to say I mean that's what I

614

00:23:36,500 --> 00:23:34,680

think she did and you're correct

615

00:23:39,230 --> 00:23:36,510

to criticize her for not doing a wider

616

00:23:40,820 --> 00:23:39,240

range of materials but you can see what

617

00:23:44,240 --> 00:23:40,830

that's the I think you notice on my

618

00:23:45,890 --> 00:23:44,250

addendum on the article I wrote did you

619

00:23:47,780 --> 00:23:45,900

see how I somebody's trying to justify

620

00:23:49,340 --> 00:23:47,790

that she'd misquoted them do you

621

00:23:51,800 --> 00:23:49,350

remember this yeah and do you remember

622

00:23:53,540 --> 00:23:51,810

that she has this quote where somebody's

623

00:23:56,120 --> 00:23:53,550

mentioning and saying I think was this

624

00:23:58,550 --> 00:23:56,130

woman says it was really Dean mobs that

625

00:23:59,930 --> 00:23:58,560

she claims that she was quoting I don't

626
00:24:03,800 --> 00:23:59,940
know if Churchland wrote that letter or

627
00:24:04,730 --> 00:24:03,810
not she did okay if she did I'll be in

628
00:24:06,530 --> 00:24:04,740
your side on this one

629
00:24:07,670 --> 00:24:06,540
if she says that let's see I don't know

630
00:24:09,500 --> 00:24:07,680
because I didn't you know I don't know

631
00:24:12,470 --> 00:24:09,510
if it's her a fake letter let's say it

632
00:24:13,400 --> 00:24:12,480
is if Churchland says that she made that

633
00:24:15,950 --> 00:24:13,410
mistake

634
00:24:18,380 --> 00:24:15,960
she's just went from the frying pan into

635
00:24:20,210 --> 00:24:18,390
the fire because that's ridiculous

636
00:24:22,730 --> 00:24:20,220
because it's not true

637
00:24:25,190 --> 00:24:22,740
because as I analyzes you can see in my

638
00:24:27,760 --> 00:24:25,200

study I did a whole analysis and it's

639

00:24:29,750 --> 00:24:27,770

clear she's based on his Lancet study

640

00:24:32,180 --> 00:24:29,760

don't you think I mean would you agree

641

00:24:34,850 --> 00:24:32,190

with that well I would conclude that

642

00:24:37,310 --> 00:24:34,860

she's just a lightweight and she's

643

00:24:39,260 --> 00:24:37,320

confused and she doesn't and she doesn't

644

00:24:41,030 --> 00:24:39,270

know what she's talking about but in to

645

00:24:44,060 --> 00:24:41,040

fill people in a little bit so it's not

646

00:24:46,570 --> 00:24:44,070

total inside baseball here right after I

647

00:24:49,760 --> 00:24:46,580

published the Churchland interview

648

00:24:53,630 --> 00:24:49,770

fortunately for me on skeptic oh I have

649

00:24:55,220 --> 00:24:53,640

a wide variety of viewpoints represented

650

00:24:57,800 --> 00:24:55,230

in my listenership so a lot of people

651
00:24:59,360 --> 00:24:57,810
are very skeptical right they jumped on

652
00:25:01,900 --> 00:24:59,370
this interview and we're really trying

653
00:25:05,540 --> 00:25:01,910
to defend Churchland and one of those

654
00:25:07,370 --> 00:25:05,550
skeptical listeners sent sure actually a

655
00:25:09,830 --> 00:25:07,380
couple of them did but one of them sent

656
00:25:11,150 --> 00:25:09,840
her an email and said hey I heard this I

657
00:25:13,730 --> 00:25:11,160
think you just made a simple mistake

658
00:25:17,330 --> 00:25:13,740
right I think you were quoting the Deen

659
00:25:20,930 --> 00:25:17,340
mobs Carolyn want paper and that's the

660
00:25:23,780 --> 00:25:20,940
confusion and then dr. Churchland

661
00:25:24,320 --> 00:25:23,790
emailed her back and said oh you're

662
00:25:27,890 --> 00:25:24,330
right

663
00:25:29,980 --> 00:25:27,900

gosh dang and she says dang D ing I hate

664

00:25:32,810 --> 00:25:29,990

when that happens I mean this is just

665

00:25:34,790 --> 00:25:32,820

mind-blowing Lee you know that's a

666

00:25:38,270 --> 00:25:34,800

mistake she needs to go back to her book

667

00:25:40,670 --> 00:25:38,280

look at The Lancet study look how she

668

00:25:43,100 --> 00:25:40,680

almost I mean I'm not saying plagiarism

669

00:25:46,430 --> 00:25:43,110

but she gets close to doing word by word

670

00:25:48,080 --> 00:25:46,440

from his study then she you can almost

671

00:25:50,000 --> 00:25:48,090

see why she does it because you

672

00:25:52,669 --> 00:25:50,010

number she then tries to explain the

673

00:25:55,340 --> 00:25:52,679

transformative experience in her own

674

00:25:57,590 --> 00:25:55,350

words because remember his study argues

675

00:26:00,519 --> 00:25:57,600

that the transformative experiences of

676

00:26:02,480 --> 00:26:00,529

NDEs are different than drug-induced

677

00:26:04,399 --> 00:26:02,490

experiences remember she's trying to

678

00:26:07,010 --> 00:26:04,409

correlate drug-induced experiences with

679

00:26:09,350 --> 00:26:07,020

NDEs well he makes a very clear

680

00:26:11,870 --> 00:26:09,360

distinction between those things and so

681

00:26:14,720 --> 00:26:11,880

if she's gonna do this it's gonna look a

682

00:26:16,880 --> 00:26:14,730

lot worse on her because it's obvious

683

00:26:19,340 --> 00:26:16,890

she used his study as I pointed out in

684

00:26:21,500 --> 00:26:19,350

that in my analysis yeah and I think you

685

00:26:24,440 --> 00:26:21,510

do a fair job of that a good job of that

686

00:26:27,100 --> 00:26:24,450

and a fair-minded job of that but dr.

687

00:26:29,360 --> 00:26:27,110

Lane I tell you what let's move off of

688

00:26:31,250 --> 00:26:29,370

near-death experience for a minute and

689

00:26:33,860 --> 00:26:31,260

it kind of the same ballpark and talk

690

00:26:36,560 --> 00:26:33,870

about consciousness science in general

691

00:26:39,740 --> 00:26:36,570

because one of my kind of frustrations

692

00:26:41,930 --> 00:26:39,750

is that sometimes we get into all this

693

00:26:44,210 --> 00:26:41,940

focus about near-death experience

694

00:26:46,549 --> 00:26:44,220

science and it can leave the impression

695

00:26:48,080 --> 00:26:46,559

that that's the main thing that's what

696

00:26:51,260 --> 00:26:48,090

we're really interested in and it's not

697

00:26:54,260 --> 00:26:51,270

for me for me it's about the implication

698

00:26:56,000 --> 00:26:54,270

of near-death experience science for

699

00:26:57,950 --> 00:26:56,010

understanding this question that you've

700

00:26:59,779 --> 00:26:57,960

studied it sounds like your whole

701
00:27:02,269 --> 00:26:59,789
professional life really your whole

702
00:27:04,340 --> 00:27:02,279
adult life and that is consciousness and

703
00:27:07,250 --> 00:27:04,350
the reason we're so interested in

704
00:27:09,950 --> 00:27:07,260
near-death experience science is because

705
00:27:12,680 --> 00:27:09,960
we have real science that comes back in

706
00:27:14,840 --> 00:27:12,690
as providing hard evidence that this

707
00:27:17,000 --> 00:27:14,850
assumption we've been making that

708
00:27:19,399 --> 00:27:17,010
consciousness is purely a product of the

709
00:27:21,980 --> 00:27:19,409
brain that somehow that is not correct

710
00:27:24,080 --> 00:27:21,990
somehow there's more and even if we

711
00:27:26,990 --> 00:27:24,090
don't want to speculate how much more

712
00:27:29,600 --> 00:27:27,000
global the consciousness or a big mind

713
00:27:32,600 --> 00:27:29,610

or any spiritual thing we have to

714

00:27:36,200 --> 00:27:32,610

confront the data that suggests hey

715

00:27:39,200 --> 00:27:36,210

there is more so first off let me stop

716

00:27:41,419 --> 00:27:39,210

there and tell me what you think about

717

00:27:45,080 --> 00:27:41,429

do you ascribe to the idea that

718

00:27:47,659 --> 00:27:45,090

consciousness is 100% brain based mind

719

00:27:50,120 --> 00:27:47,669

equals brain you know I honestly I am

720

00:27:52,220 --> 00:27:50,130

too stupid to make that kind of absolute

721

00:27:55,220 --> 00:27:52,230

conclusion I want to keep an open mind

722

00:27:57,100 --> 00:27:55,230

but I will tell you my bias my bias is

723

00:27:59,530 --> 00:27:57,110

that skeptics

724

00:28:01,720 --> 00:27:59,540

and like including people like Daniel

725

00:28:03,760 --> 00:28:01,730

Dennett you know in Dawkins and the

726

00:28:06,370 --> 00:28:03,770

hardcores I think they're really doing

727

00:28:08,890 --> 00:28:06,380

us a huge favor because what they do is

728

00:28:10,420 --> 00:28:08,900

they not all the time granted they're

729

00:28:11,920 --> 00:28:10,430

gonna make huge blunders and mistakes

730

00:28:14,050 --> 00:28:11,930

I'm not arguing that but what they are

731

00:28:17,080 --> 00:28:14,060

basically saying is give me more

732

00:28:18,430 --> 00:28:17,090

evidence and I note in my own life that

733

00:28:20,380 --> 00:28:18,440

when people are skeptical I can that be

734

00:28:22,960 --> 00:28:20,390

I can car or the John Roger Hinkins

735

00:28:25,150 --> 00:28:22,970

thing or the Sathya Sai Baba thing that

736

00:28:26,230 --> 00:28:25,160

happened people got pissed at me as you

737

00:28:27,970 --> 00:28:26,240

know I got death threats in everything

738

00:28:29,320 --> 00:28:27,980

they said we want more evidence they

739

00:28:31,240 --> 00:28:29,330

don't even believe the pointers in stem

740

00:28:34,000 --> 00:28:31,250

and instead of seeing that as a negative

741

00:28:36,550 --> 00:28:34,010

I see it as a positive because if

742

00:28:39,820 --> 00:28:36,560

consciousness indeed transcends the

743

00:28:42,160 --> 00:28:39,830

brain then no materialistic explanation

744

00:28:44,230 --> 00:28:42,170

will be sufficient to explain it

745

00:28:46,150 --> 00:28:44,240

therefore neuroscience is going to end

746

00:28:48,730 --> 00:28:46,160

up heading into a pistol illogical

747

00:28:51,100 --> 00:28:48,740

cul-de-sac and get their ass kicked

748

00:28:53,770 --> 00:28:51,110

which is really good but if we don't let

749

00:28:57,130 --> 00:28:53,780

them place skepticism to their full a

750

00:28:59,620 --> 00:28:57,140

full arena then there's a danger because

751
00:29:03,550 --> 00:28:59,630
believers part of my language are cheap

752
00:29:05,200 --> 00:29:03,560
[h__h] for the paranormal as youkai I'm

753
00:29:07,510 --> 00:29:05,210
sure you're aware that some people will

754
00:29:08,860 --> 00:29:07,520
believe anything like sathya sai pop is

755
00:29:10,720 --> 00:29:08,870
probably the best example I can think up

756
00:29:12,580 --> 00:29:10,730
for 30 to 40 years I dealt with people

757
00:29:14,470 --> 00:29:12,590
telling me he had paranormal powers and

758
00:29:16,030 --> 00:29:14,480
as you perhaps have seen the study it

759
00:29:18,400 --> 00:29:16,040
turns out he was a bad sleight of hand

760
00:29:20,470 --> 00:29:18,410
magician or John Roger Hinkins who is

761
00:29:22,570 --> 00:29:20,480
the founder of MSI a who robbed my house

762
00:29:24,250 --> 00:29:22,580
we will go in the detail there he was

763
00:29:25,780 --> 00:29:24,260

apparently psychic I knew the guy and he

764

00:29:27,370 --> 00:29:25,790

was telling me things I I was thinking

765

00:29:28,750 --> 00:29:27,380

about in the bathroom because I was kind

766

00:29:32,290 --> 00:29:28,760

of talking out loud well it turns out he

767

00:29:34,660 --> 00:29:32,300

wired his entire house so the skeptic is

768

00:29:38,050 --> 00:29:34,670

good in this sense because he's made

769

00:29:40,420 --> 00:29:38,060

sense in that sense but then that

770

00:29:43,120 --> 00:29:40,430

parameter they're saying up your game

771

00:29:45,190 --> 00:29:43,130

and I think what's exciting about this

772

00:29:47,260 --> 00:29:45,200

is that you're getting these medical

773

00:29:48,850 --> 00:29:47,270

these neurosurgeons like that that new

774

00:29:51,730 --> 00:29:48,860

book that railways been out for a while

775

00:29:54,130 --> 00:29:51,740

called proof of heaven by Evan Alexander

776

00:29:56,530 --> 00:29:54,140

you got people with you know incredible

777

00:29:58,900 --> 00:29:56,540

interesting reputations and credentials

778

00:30:00,670 --> 00:29:58,910

smart people who are basically saying

779

00:30:02,560 --> 00:30:00,680

that consciousness transcends the brain

780

00:30:04,300 --> 00:30:02,570

well even Sam Harris

781

00:30:05,800 --> 00:30:04,310

you know Sam Harris has got a new book

782

00:30:08,110 --> 00:30:05,810

coming out called waking up in which

783

00:30:09,529 --> 00:30:08,120

he's talking about the meditation and

784

00:30:11,450 --> 00:30:09,539

things of that nature he

785

00:30:14,769 --> 00:30:11,460

even argues against Dennett in

786

00:30:17,419 --> 00:30:14,779

Churchland and says you cannot explain

787

00:30:19,190 --> 00:30:17,429

consciousness the way you think you are

788

00:30:21,080 --> 00:30:19,200

he argues that they're not he says

789

00:30:22,279 --> 00:30:21,090

consciousness is this almost an effort

790

00:30:24,019 --> 00:30:22,289

of both a even though he may say it's

791

00:30:26,479 --> 00:30:24,029

part of the brain yeah but he's just

792

00:30:28,460 --> 00:30:26,489

slide he's just trying to slide into

793

00:30:30,229 --> 00:30:28,470

this middle position and I think quite

794

00:30:32,749 --> 00:30:30,239

in exchange with him that it is a

795

00:30:34,700 --> 00:30:32,759

nowhere position it's like this you know

796

00:30:37,489 --> 00:30:34,710

I'm not a Christian I'm not as an

797

00:30:40,669 --> 00:30:37,499

atheist I'll be an agnostic which is

798

00:30:43,129 --> 00:30:40,679

nothing no one lays their head on the

799

00:30:45,859 --> 00:30:43,139

pillow at night and says gee you know I

800

00:30:47,810 --> 00:30:45,869

don't believe anything you go one way or

801

00:30:50,810 --> 00:30:47,820

another it's the famous South Park

802

00:30:52,879 --> 00:30:50,820

episode captured that well you know

803

00:30:54,619 --> 00:30:52,889

maybe maybe though honestly though you

804

00:30:55,849 --> 00:30:54,629

know I was taken of Edward Wilson it's

805

00:30:56,629 --> 00:30:55,859

kind of an exaggeration you know we

806

00:30:58,669 --> 00:30:56,639

weren't very famous book called

807

00:31:00,859 --> 00:30:58,679

consilience he's the emeritus professor

808

00:31:02,419 --> 00:31:00,869

of biology at Harvard and he argued

809

00:31:04,149 --> 00:31:02,429

about the triune brain now obviously the

810

00:31:06,499 --> 00:31:04,159

triune brain is kind of an overstated

811

00:31:08,450 --> 00:31:06,509

reductionism but I kind of noticed the

812

00:31:09,950 --> 00:31:08,460

same thing in myself there's this top

813

00:31:11,779 --> 00:31:09,960

part of my brain we'll call he called it

814

00:31:14,359 --> 00:31:11,789

the heartless part of yourself the

815

00:31:16,279 --> 00:31:14,369

cerebral cortex and it's kind of

816

00:31:17,919 --> 00:31:16,289

rational and kind of skeptical and kind

817

00:31:20,479 --> 00:31:17,929

of thing and the mid part of my brain is

818

00:31:22,190 --> 00:31:20,489

you know the emotional mammalian

819

00:31:23,389 --> 00:31:22,200

structure and then of course the lower

820

00:31:25,549 --> 00:31:23,399

part of the brain which is probably the

821

00:31:27,739 --> 00:31:25,559

most powerful the reptilian stem and I

822

00:31:30,469 --> 00:31:27,749

notice with myself that there's this

823

00:31:31,700 --> 00:31:30,479

emotional believe inside who really

824

00:31:33,169 --> 00:31:31,710

thinks there might be something beyond

825

00:31:35,359 --> 00:31:33,179

the body in the mind and is open to it

826

00:31:38,599 --> 00:31:35,369

and then there's that Spock part of my

827

00:31:40,310 --> 00:31:38,609

side data side that goes I [\h__\h] we

828

00:31:41,749 --> 00:31:40,320

kind of know you're just the brain Dave

829

00:31:43,909 --> 00:31:41,759

that's why nobody hits himself with a

830

00:31:45,619 --> 00:31:43,919

hammer or why you go to the doctor or a

831

00:31:47,749 --> 00:31:45,629

dentist and you have a root canal

832

00:31:50,149 --> 00:31:47,759

problem you think pain is really located

833

00:31:51,830 --> 00:31:50,159

in the brain so I I can understand why

834

00:31:52,820 --> 00:31:51,840

somebody could be of two minds does that

835

00:31:55,700 --> 00:31:52,830

make sense kind of you see where I'm

836

00:31:59,479 --> 00:31:55,710

going with this it does but that's why

837

00:32:01,430 --> 00:31:59,489

we need the rigor of science yes and we

838

00:32:03,979 --> 00:32:01,440

need to level the playing field I mean

839

00:32:06,680 --> 00:32:03,989

part of the problem with the up your

840

00:32:09,859 --> 00:32:06,690

game kind of position that you're taking

841

00:32:14,149 --> 00:32:09,869

is that at this point the game has been

842

00:32:17,200 --> 00:32:14,159

so rigged against anyone who challenges

843

00:32:19,970 --> 00:32:17,210

this scientific materialism that it's

844

00:32:22,249 --> 00:32:19,980

essentially impossible for anyone to go

845

00:32:22,710 --> 00:32:22,259

forward in any meaningful way on that

846

00:32:26,220 --> 00:32:22,720

now I

847

00:32:28,049 --> 00:32:26,230

250 shows to back up what I'm talking

848

00:32:31,409 --> 00:32:28,059

about there so I'll just kind of leave

849

00:32:32,970 --> 00:32:31,419

it at that but I way of reinforcing that

850

00:32:35,310 --> 00:32:32,980

I guess I'd come back to your article

851

00:32:36,539 --> 00:32:35,320

and and maybe dig into this

852

00:32:37,980 --> 00:32:36,549

consciousness thing because another

853

00:32:40,340 --> 00:32:37,990

interesting quote from there that I was

854

00:32:43,919 --> 00:32:40,350

gonna beat you up a little bit about

855

00:32:46,470 --> 00:32:43,929

suggest that I conflate Churchland

856

00:32:49,500 --> 00:32:46,480

nuanced understanding of consciousness

857

00:32:53,520 --> 00:32:49,510

with my own caricatures of Daniel

858

00:32:56,610 --> 00:32:53,530

Dennett and Richard Dawkins explain to

859

00:33:00,060 --> 00:32:56,620

me what you think are the nuances of

860

00:33:03,320 --> 00:33:00,070

that consciousness that I'm not getting

861

00:33:06,360 --> 00:33:03,330

through Daniel Dennett who famously said

862

00:33:09,360 --> 00:33:06,370

consciousness is an illusion and Richard

863

00:33:12,210 --> 00:33:09,370

Dawkins who famously said were

864

00:33:14,460 --> 00:33:12,220

biological robots I don't think those

865

00:33:17,460 --> 00:33:14,470

are caricatures I think that's what

866

00:33:19,230 --> 00:33:17,470

those guys really think or they might

867

00:33:21,029 --> 00:33:19,240

but you remember you were interviewing

868

00:33:22,919 --> 00:33:21,039

Churchland and if you remember

869

00:33:25,020 --> 00:33:22,929

Churchland corrects you at that point

870

00:33:26,640 --> 00:33:25,030

and says well that's not my view and

871

00:33:28,710 --> 00:33:26,650

then she explained that regardless of

872

00:33:30,330 --> 00:33:28,720

whether we accept review I think if you

873

00:33:31,649 --> 00:33:30,340

really wanted to understand her view

874

00:33:34,230 --> 00:33:31,659

it's almost like even somebody along

875

00:33:36,750 --> 00:33:34,240

noose around their neck or a long rope

876

00:33:38,250 --> 00:33:36,760

that was what I was commenting on I was

877

00:33:39,690 --> 00:33:38,260

basically alright I'm not arguing that

878

00:33:40,950 --> 00:33:39,700

Dawkins doesn't say that or denno didn't

879

00:33:42,750 --> 00:33:40,960

say I was simply saying that Churchill

880

00:33:43,740 --> 00:33:42,760

and he corrects that view what I was

881

00:33:45,180 --> 00:33:43,750

pointing out David when we were just

882

00:33:48,210 --> 00:33:45,190

talking about this about Sam Harris a

883

00:33:49,500 --> 00:33:48,220

minute ago is these guys like Churchland

884

00:33:51,180 --> 00:33:49,510

who've already said as a lightweight who

885

00:33:54,680 --> 00:33:51,190

doesn't know what she's talking about on

886

00:33:57,659 --> 00:33:54,690

this topic is trying to slither her way

887

00:34:00,360 --> 00:33:57,669

into this emergent property of

888

00:34:02,460 --> 00:34:00,370

consciousness without any clue of what

889

00:34:04,860 --> 00:34:02,470

that means so as soon as she's pressed

890

00:34:07,890 --> 00:34:04,870

with well what does emergent property of

891

00:34:09,869 --> 00:34:07,900

the brain mean dr. Churchland when does

892

00:34:11,849 --> 00:34:09,879

consciousness begin when does it end

893

00:34:14,369 --> 00:34:11,859

what is necessary and sufficient to

894

00:34:16,109 --> 00:34:14,379

cause consciousness our dog's conscious

895

00:34:17,669 --> 00:34:16,119

are these cats were running around my

896

00:34:20,129 --> 00:34:17,679

office cousin all this commotion are

897

00:34:22,379 --> 00:34:20,139

they conscious is a rock conscious she

898

00:34:24,780 --> 00:34:22,389

doesn't have in she doesn't even have

899

00:34:27,270 --> 00:34:24,790

the beginnings of an answer to that and

900

00:34:30,359 --> 00:34:27,280

yet she wants to put forward this idea

901
00:34:32,250 --> 00:34:30,369
that she has somehow moved past Daniel

902
00:34:34,680 --> 00:34:32,260
Dennett and Richard Dawkins in what way

903
00:34:36,119 --> 00:34:34,690
have you moved past well I mean it comes

904
00:34:37,979 --> 00:34:36,129
down to a question do you want

905
00:34:39,719 --> 00:34:37,989
yummy are you doing an interview to kind

906
00:34:41,460 --> 00:34:39,729
of have a debate with her or you have an

907
00:34:43,259 --> 00:34:41,470
interview for her to elaborate her

908
00:34:45,329 --> 00:34:43,269
viewpoint these aren't going with us

909
00:34:49,200 --> 00:34:45,339
because having an interview with her to

910
00:34:51,329 --> 00:34:49,210
expose how ridiculous it is for this

911
00:34:53,579 --> 00:34:51,339
person to be writing books on

912
00:34:56,879 --> 00:34:53,589
consciousness to be teaching our

913
00:35:00,839 --> 00:34:56,889

children these ridiculous ideas that she

914

00:35:03,569 --> 00:35:00,849

can't defend in in even the most basic

915

00:35:06,960 --> 00:35:03,579

way I'm just calling the emperor has no

916

00:35:08,910 --> 00:35:06,970

clothes the entire idea that this

917

00:35:11,370 --> 00:35:08,920

consciousness is an illusion is just

918

00:35:13,140 --> 00:35:11,380

silliness that gets perpetuated and

919

00:35:16,109 --> 00:35:13,150

never gets challenged in any meaningful

920

00:35:18,390 --> 00:35:16,119

way I like you gotta be careful though

921

00:35:20,729 --> 00:35:18,400

because he with me is that you just want

922

00:35:22,799 --> 00:35:20,739

to be accurate to what she said did she

923

00:35:25,799 --> 00:35:22,809

really say consciousness was an illusion

924

00:35:27,120 --> 00:35:25,809

herself and that you said that to her

925

00:35:28,890 --> 00:35:27,130

she said consciousness is an emergent

926

00:35:30,839 --> 00:35:28,900

property the gantt brain and I called

927

00:35:32,370 --> 00:35:30,849

around what kind of that's that what

928

00:35:34,259 --> 00:35:32,380

does that mean right and that's fine

929

00:35:35,849 --> 00:35:34,269

that's fair Katie but what I'm saying is

930

00:35:37,890 --> 00:35:35,859

you just want to be accurate to what she

931

00:35:39,390 --> 00:35:37,900

says not trying to you know create these

932

00:35:42,029 --> 00:35:39,400

characters yours that she can knock down

933

00:35:44,190 --> 00:35:42,039

as strong men because your argument

934

00:35:46,469 --> 00:35:44,200

would be stronger if you just take her

935

00:35:47,910 --> 00:35:46,479

own words that was really my analysis

936

00:35:49,259 --> 00:35:47,920

that I was giving it in the paper but

937

00:35:52,289 --> 00:35:49,269

let me push this a little differently

938

00:35:54,209 --> 00:35:52,299

let's let's just keep an open mind now

939

00:35:56,789 --> 00:35:54,219

would you agree I think we would agree

940

00:35:58,739 --> 00:35:56,799

that that certain parts of our

941

00:36:00,420 --> 00:35:58,749

consciousness clearly have some

942

00:36:02,910 --> 00:36:00,430

neurological correlations would you

943

00:36:05,039 --> 00:36:02,920

agree with that certainly same so yeah

944

00:36:06,029 --> 00:36:05,049

no they seem like okay so watch how many

945

00:36:09,059 --> 00:36:06,039

to go with this this is kind of the way

946

00:36:11,249 --> 00:36:09,069

I do it does when I go to the dentist do

947

00:36:13,589 --> 00:36:11,259

I want him to think that the pain that I

948

00:36:15,450 --> 00:36:13,599

have from my wisdom tooth is part and

949

00:36:17,160 --> 00:36:15,460

parcel of my brain let's say or part of

950

00:36:19,920 --> 00:36:17,170

my peripheral nervous system the answer

951
00:36:22,109 --> 00:36:19,930
is yes do I go when I have eye surgery

952
00:36:24,660 --> 00:36:22,119
let's say do I want him to be thinking

953
00:36:26,309 --> 00:36:24,670
that I am this this eyeball is connected

954
00:36:27,569 --> 00:36:26,319
to my brain yeah well it's the same

955
00:36:29,339 --> 00:36:27,579
thing with me hearing I recently had

956
00:36:31,229 --> 00:36:29,349
nasal surgery because I served too much

957
00:36:33,269 --> 00:36:31,239
and I couldn't smell for like four or

958
00:36:35,039 --> 00:36:33,279
five years and I got the surgery and I

959
00:36:36,809 --> 00:36:35,049
could smell again and he's a

960
00:36:39,239 --> 00:36:36,819
neurosurgeon he's very smart guy he

961
00:36:40,979 --> 00:36:39,249
knows how the brain works so on one

962
00:36:43,920 --> 00:36:40,989
level here comes a more different way of

963
00:36:46,620 --> 00:36:43,930

putting this it's kind of a pun I think

964

00:36:48,110 --> 00:36:46,630

it's posted it on Facebook if we are

965

00:36:53,390 --> 00:36:48,120

matter

966

00:36:56,060 --> 00:36:53,400

what's the problem if we are just the

967

00:36:58,430 --> 00:36:56,070

brain because physics itself like matter

968

00:37:01,400 --> 00:36:58,440

itself is more mysterious in a weird way

969

00:37:03,260 --> 00:37:01,410

the spirit even describes because think

970

00:37:04,910 --> 00:37:03,270

about you got the level of a of a tree

971

00:37:06,710 --> 00:37:04,920

then you get the level of cells and you

972

00:37:08,540 --> 00:37:06,720

got the level of molecules the level of

973

00:37:10,220 --> 00:37:08,550

atoms you break it all the way down you

974

00:37:11,870 --> 00:37:10,230

get down to the nucleus of the atom

975

00:37:14,090 --> 00:37:11,880

you got the proton the electrons

976
00:37:15,680 --> 00:37:14,100
manifesting quarks then you get down to

977
00:37:17,660 --> 00:37:15,690
super string and then Sir Arthur

978
00:37:19,190 --> 00:37:17,670
Eddington pointed out he was a famous

979
00:37:21,290 --> 00:37:19,200
astronomer who confirmed with more or

980
00:37:23,870 --> 00:37:21,300
less confirmed Einstein's general theory

981
00:37:26,180 --> 00:37:23,880
of relativity back in 1919 he said this

982
00:37:30,620 --> 00:37:26,190
is what I quote him exactly something

983
00:37:33,620 --> 00:37:30,630
unknown is doing what I don't know so

984
00:37:37,580 --> 00:37:33,630
watch the Trojan horse here let's just

985
00:37:41,000 --> 00:37:37,590
say it's all matter that doesn't explain

986
00:37:43,790 --> 00:37:41,010
it because matter itself is as mystical

987
00:37:45,380 --> 00:37:43,800
as saying it's all spirit I gave this

988
00:37:46,970 --> 00:37:45,390

talk in India I actually was a video

989

00:37:48,350 --> 00:37:46,980

conference because I couldn't go to

990

00:37:50,690 --> 00:37:48,360

India to do it at the dialogue

991

00:37:53,660 --> 00:37:50,700

educational institute and I made this

992

00:37:55,310 --> 00:37:53,670

real simple point I said if we were in

993

00:37:56,480 --> 00:37:55,320

heaven you and I are let's imagine we're

994

00:37:58,820 --> 00:37:56,490

in heaven and we're having this

995

00:38:01,940 --> 00:37:58,830

conversation and you said what are we

996

00:38:04,190 --> 00:38:01,950

made out of and you say Dave were made

997

00:38:06,770 --> 00:38:04,200

out of light were radiant beings of

998

00:38:09,350 --> 00:38:06,780

light I wouldn't get depressed I think

999

00:38:12,590 --> 00:38:09,360

oh that's cool that's really neat but

1000

00:38:14,660 --> 00:38:12,600

here on terra firma when we find out

1001
00:38:16,790 --> 00:38:14,670
that somebody says you just matter we

1002
00:38:17,750 --> 00:38:16,800
get depressed i've suggested we get

1003
00:38:20,450 --> 00:38:17,760
depressed because we have a bad

1004
00:38:22,850 --> 00:38:20,460
definition of what matter actually is

1005
00:38:25,280 --> 00:38:22,860
cuz good eat you cos MC squared by

1006
00:38:27,380 --> 00:38:25,290
Einstein matters energy matters light

1007
00:38:29,600 --> 00:38:27,390
you and I are congealed particles of

1008
00:38:31,820 --> 00:38:29,610
light or frozen popsicles of light so on

1009
00:38:34,310 --> 00:38:31,830
one level if you give them the

1010
00:38:36,920 --> 00:38:34,320
materialist argument it's gonna bite

1011
00:38:39,560 --> 00:38:36,930
them in the posterior because nobody

1012
00:38:42,710 --> 00:38:39,570
knows what matter ultimately is that

1013
00:38:44,470 --> 00:38:42,720

makes a sense it does in a very

1014

00:38:48,230 --> 00:38:44,480

interesting and I mean that sincerely

1015

00:38:48,890 --> 00:38:48,240

philosophical kind of I mean that I mean

1016

00:38:52,040 --> 00:38:48,900

that sincerely

1017

00:38:53,480 --> 00:38:52,050

but it gets back to really your your

1018

00:38:55,760 --> 00:38:53,490

work in the body of your work that

1019

00:38:58,930 --> 00:38:55,770

you've created in some way in that if

1020

00:39:02,030 --> 00:38:58,940

there is this larger reality of

1021

00:39:03,740 --> 00:39:02,040

consciousness of spirituality let's

1022

00:39:05,210 --> 00:39:03,750

put that term on it because that's where

1023

00:39:07,460 --> 00:39:05,220

things really head if you go down that

1024

00:39:10,850 --> 00:39:07,470

path very far then you can pretty

1025

00:39:14,030 --> 00:39:10,860

quickly come to this realization that

1026

00:39:16,250 --> 00:39:14,040

this reality isn't reality this isn't

1027

00:39:18,740 --> 00:39:16,260

real and therefore anything that we

1028

00:39:20,540 --> 00:39:18,750

might postulate or kind of speculate

1029

00:39:24,650 --> 00:39:20,550

about is really just kind of does it

1030

00:39:27,770 --> 00:39:24,660

matter anyway and anyone in these cults

1031

00:39:30,170 --> 00:39:27,780

or in these new-age religious movements

1032

00:39:32,960 --> 00:39:30,180

that you've studied so well could say

1033

00:39:35,390 --> 00:39:32,970

the same thing let's say Dave you don't

1034

00:39:38,120 --> 00:39:35,400

realize it doesn't matter if I'm doing

1035

00:39:40,640 --> 00:39:38,130

sleight of hand because it's all the

1036

00:39:42,890 --> 00:39:40,650

same buddy we're all getting to the same

1037

00:39:45,170 --> 00:39:42,900

place and instead you've stepped in

1038

00:39:47,690 --> 00:39:45,180

there and said well wait a minute as you

1039

00:39:50,390 --> 00:39:47,700

said in this terra firma in this reality

1040

00:39:52,250 --> 00:39:50,400

i like to say in this consensus reality

1041

00:39:54,080 --> 00:39:52,260

where we can say yeah there is a wave

1042

00:39:56,930 --> 00:39:54,090

out there and I served it this morning

1043

00:39:59,270 --> 00:39:56,940

in this consensus reality it does make a

1044

00:40:01,610 --> 00:39:59,280

difference you're a fraud you're

1045

00:40:04,730 --> 00:40:01,620

injuring people you shouldn't do that

1046

00:40:08,000 --> 00:40:04,740

and I'm going to stop you in the same

1047

00:40:11,030 --> 00:40:08,010

way I think we have to use the best

1048

00:40:12,740 --> 00:40:11,040

means we have to be precise here and to

1049

00:40:16,460 --> 00:40:12,750

say that's not good enough

1050

00:40:19,430 --> 00:40:16,470

yes this consciousness does seem if it

1051

00:40:21,650 --> 00:40:19,440

is established as I think it clearly is

1052

00:40:23,870 --> 00:40:21,660

that consciousness cannot be explained

1053

00:40:26,120 --> 00:40:23,880

purely by the biological function your

1054

00:40:29,390 --> 00:40:26,130

brain then we just got a bucket up and

1055

00:40:32,060 --> 00:40:29,400

deal with that and not try and find a

1056

00:40:34,280 --> 00:40:32,070

trick back door to why that might be

1057

00:40:35,570 --> 00:40:34,290

okay we have to do our best to see it's

1058

00:40:37,880 --> 00:40:35,580

either real or it isn't

1059

00:40:39,590 --> 00:40:37,890

well I'll again I kind of us feeling it

1060

00:40:42,020 --> 00:40:39,600

posted this morning where we can do a

1061

00:40:44,210 --> 00:40:42,030

two-pronged approach I mean we can both

1062

00:40:46,070 --> 00:40:44,220

be skeptical I guess you the most famous

1063

00:40:48,260 --> 00:40:46,080

story I have related to this is a guy

1064

00:40:50,900 --> 00:40:48,270

named faqir chand who was a pretty

1065

00:40:53,060 --> 00:40:50,910

famous gu he's been dead since 1981 and

1066

00:40:55,100 --> 00:40:53,070

he meditated or coq try to induce a

1067

00:40:56,720 --> 00:40:55,110

conscious near-death experience his

1068

00:40:59,030 --> 00:40:56,730

whole life and he did it it became very

1069

00:41:01,310 --> 00:40:59,040

successful and having conscious OBEs

1070

00:41:02,480 --> 00:41:01,320

they did this practice called shop at

1071

00:41:05,840 --> 00:41:02,490

yoga and he did it for like 70 years

1072

00:41:08,480 --> 00:41:05,850

very interesting God and he can have

1073

00:41:09,830 --> 00:41:08,490

these ability to leave his body and go

1074

00:41:11,330 --> 00:41:09,840

to different realms of consciousness

1075

00:41:12,140 --> 00:41:11,340

exactly what the point that you're

1076
00:41:13,990 --> 00:41:12,150
trying to make you know because

1077
00:41:16,270 --> 00:41:14,000
eventually gets spiritual right

1078
00:41:19,050 --> 00:41:16,280
what's so interesting about him however

1079
00:41:21,339 --> 00:41:19,060
is that he began to doubt the

1080
00:41:24,430 --> 00:41:21,349
explanations of what was happening in

1081
00:41:26,530 --> 00:41:24,440
those out-of-body experiences so like in

1082
00:41:28,570 --> 00:41:26,540
1919 is in Basel on a Baghdad just right

1083
00:41:29,890 --> 00:41:28,580
after World War one and he thinks he's

1084
00:41:32,770 --> 00:41:29,900
gonna get killed he thinks he's gonna

1085
00:41:35,109 --> 00:41:32,780
dies with his compatriots and he has a

1086
00:41:36,310 --> 00:41:35,119
vision of his guru maha rishi ship

1087
00:41:38,680 --> 00:41:36,320
Bradlaugh don't worry about the name and

1088
00:41:40,150 --> 00:41:38,690

the Guru says don't shoot the enemy they

1089

00:41:41,830 --> 00:41:40,160

just come to take away their dead

1090

00:41:43,300 --> 00:41:41,840

well fakir Chandan follows the

1091

00:41:44,950 --> 00:41:43,310

instructions tells the super dar major

1092

00:41:46,839 --> 00:41:44,960

everybody's life is saved but it's

1093

00:41:49,120 --> 00:41:46,849

around the same time however as he goes

1094

00:41:50,950 --> 00:41:49,130

back to Baghdad he sees his old friends

1095

00:41:53,349 --> 00:41:50,960

from India and they start to bow and

1096

00:41:55,060 --> 00:41:53,359

worship Nikhil what he was why did

1097

00:41:57,040 --> 00:41:55,070

worshipping me they said don't you know

1098

00:41:59,980 --> 00:41:57,050

we were in the battlefield we prayed to

1099

00:42:02,140 --> 00:41:59,990

a guru but he didn't show up you showed

1100

00:42:03,730 --> 00:42:02,150

up Fricker Chand and saved our lives a

1101

00:42:05,349 --> 00:42:03,740

fakir cheong looked at me he was smoking

1102

00:42:07,450 --> 00:42:05,359

a hookah Piper I checked it was tobacco

1103

00:42:10,180 --> 00:42:07,460

he goes David I didn't know anything

1104

00:42:11,260 --> 00:42:10,190

about it who appeared to them right and

1105

00:42:12,430 --> 00:42:11,270

so he starts to show me these letters

1106

00:42:14,020 --> 00:42:12,440

about all these people having these

1107

00:42:14,980 --> 00:42:14,030

incredible miracles and visions about

1108

00:42:17,849 --> 00:42:14,990

him and he goes I don't know anything

1109

00:42:20,859 --> 00:42:17,859

about it so he began to doubt the

1110

00:42:22,870 --> 00:42:20,869

explanation doubt the experience but he

1111

00:42:24,550 --> 00:42:22,880

endowed the doubted the interpretation

1112

00:42:26,859 --> 00:42:24,560

of what was occurring so he later

1113

00:42:28,930 --> 00:42:26,869

radically said this is all a projection

1114

00:42:31,599 --> 00:42:28,940

of my own line now faqir chand did

1115

00:42:33,790 --> 00:42:31,609

believe that consciousness may transcend

1116

00:42:35,829 --> 00:42:33,800

the body but I have the only reason I

1117

00:42:37,480 --> 00:42:35,839

mentioned this to you is that I think we

1118

00:42:39,190 --> 00:42:37,490

could take a two pronged approach it

1119

00:42:41,770 --> 00:42:39,200

doesn't have to be one versus the other

1120

00:42:43,120 --> 00:42:41,780

I I meditate just between you and will

1121

00:42:45,430 --> 00:42:43,130

not between if the whole world I

1122

00:42:46,870 --> 00:42:45,440

meditate every day maybe an hour and a

1123

00:42:50,079 --> 00:42:46,880

half two hours a day a lot my kids think

1124

00:42:52,589 --> 00:42:50,089

I'm annotate too much and I love that's

1125

00:42:54,579 --> 00:42:52,599

the feeling of that sensation of

1126

00:42:56,740 --> 00:42:54,589

meditation because it feels spiritual

1127

00:43:00,070 --> 00:42:56,750

right but maybe later on that afternoon

1128

00:43:02,320 --> 00:43:00,080

I could read a lot of Dawkins and Hara

1129

00:43:04,570 --> 00:43:02,330

so the late Christopher Hitchens or

1130

00:43:07,359 --> 00:43:04,580

Daniel Dennett or Gerald Edelman

1131

00:43:12,579 --> 00:43:07,369

they take on my skeptical hat try to be

1132

00:43:14,560 --> 00:43:12,589

injured I mean I just enjoy doing that I

1133

00:43:17,260 --> 00:43:14,570

think it's fun because as f scott

1134

00:43:19,359 --> 00:43:17,270

Fitzgerald to quote from his famous

1135

00:43:22,240 --> 00:43:19,369

essay for Esquire called the crack-up

1136

00:43:24,339 --> 00:43:22,250

back in the 1930s he said the sign of an

1137

00:43:27,000 --> 00:43:24,349

intelligent mind is the ability they

1138

00:43:30,120 --> 00:43:27,010

have two opposing ideas

1139

00:43:32,700 --> 00:43:30,130

yeah at the same time and not go nuts or

1140

00:43:34,770 --> 00:43:32,710

be able to function so I think what

1141

00:43:37,980 --> 00:43:34,780

you've done I'll give you a real Kudo

1142

00:43:40,290 --> 00:43:37,990

here you become the skeptic of the

1143

00:43:43,590 --> 00:43:40,300

skeptic and that's important because

1144

00:43:46,560 --> 00:43:43,600

what it does it forces the skeptic

1145

00:43:49,740 --> 00:43:46,570

whenever I said game on it forces this

1146

00:43:51,690 --> 00:43:49,750

skeptic to raise the stakes and with

1147

00:43:54,390 --> 00:43:51,700

Churchland I think you do clearly point

1148

00:43:57,510 --> 00:43:54,400

out she did not do enough background

1149

00:43:59,810 --> 00:43:57,520

research and just to quote Lancet enough

1150

00:44:03,420 --> 00:43:59,820

is insufficient that I agree with you

1151
00:44:05,970 --> 00:44:03,430
you know the only problem with that is

1152
00:44:09,060 --> 00:44:05,980
that what I've found in this journey of

1153
00:44:13,260 --> 00:44:09,070
mine through the skeptical community is

1154
00:44:17,430 --> 00:44:13,270
that it's not two opinions there's

1155
00:44:19,520 --> 00:44:17,440
another force at play there's a power

1156
00:44:23,130 --> 00:44:19,530
structure there that is

1157
00:44:26,490 --> 00:44:23,140
self-perpetuating skeptics are the tip

1158
00:44:29,480 --> 00:44:26,500
of the spear for scientific materialism

1159
00:44:33,240 --> 00:44:29,490
and scientific materialism is

1160
00:44:37,400 --> 00:44:33,250
fundamental to our way of life you can't

1161
00:44:40,620 --> 00:44:37,410
go drop bombs on people and shoot

1162
00:44:44,840 --> 00:44:40,630
depleted uranium from your tanks at the

1163
00:44:47,880 --> 00:44:44,850

Iraqis unless you have a scientific

1164

00:44:51,120 --> 00:44:47,890
materialistic worldview it is not

1165

00:44:53,940 --> 00:44:51,130
possible you can't grab all the world's

1166

00:44:57,200 --> 00:44:53,950
water and say hey if you're thirsty too

1167

00:45:00,270 --> 00:44:57,210
bad you can't do that if we're all

1168

00:45:02,460 --> 00:45:00,280
really connected I'm not trying to be

1169

00:45:06,359 --> 00:45:02,470
spiritual here I'm just trying to be

1170

00:45:09,000 --> 00:45:06,369
practical so there are some major forces

1171

00:45:11,460 --> 00:45:09,010
at play here and we don't know I'm not

1172

00:45:14,250 --> 00:45:11,470
smart enough or savvy enough or

1173

00:45:16,349 --> 00:45:14,260
connected enough to know the extent to

1174

00:45:18,120 --> 00:45:16,359
which they're at play but they're sure

1175

00:45:21,330 --> 00:45:18,130
as hell at play here

1176
00:45:24,930 --> 00:45:21,340
so these skeptics are allowed to run out

1177
00:45:26,520 --> 00:45:24,940
there like jackals and jesters and play

1178
00:45:29,280 --> 00:45:26,530
these dirty tricks

1179
00:45:32,580 --> 00:45:29,290
because again they're the tip of the

1180
00:45:37,170 --> 00:45:32,590
spear for a scientific establishment who

1181
00:45:39,609 --> 00:45:37,180
needs that kind of mischief-making so

1182
00:45:41,439 --> 00:45:39,619
that they can keep business as usual

1183
00:45:43,089 --> 00:45:41,449
at one point on that you know having

1184
00:45:44,829 --> 00:45:43,099
gone through you know a fairly rigorous

1185
00:45:47,229 --> 00:45:44,839
program at UCSD and knowing lots of

1186
00:45:49,359 --> 00:45:47,239
scientific friends of mine I'm not sure

1187
00:45:51,939 --> 00:45:49,369
that's true I mean I agree with you that

1188
00:45:53,679 --> 00:45:51,949

the overarching paradigm is to reduce

1189

00:45:56,170 --> 00:45:53,689

things to material structures I agree

1190

00:45:58,569 --> 00:45:56,180

yeah but this is against the Iraq war I

1191

00:46:00,519 --> 00:45:58,579

think it's ridiculous but my sense of it

1192

00:46:02,410 --> 00:46:00,529

that has more to do with capitalism and

1193

00:46:04,900 --> 00:46:02,420

not necessarily with science even though

1194

00:46:07,569 --> 00:46:04,910

a quite agree that that the capitalism

1195

00:46:10,150 --> 00:46:07,579

can sabotage debut totally totally it's

1196

00:46:13,539 --> 00:46:10,160

it's not like some professor at UCSD has

1197

00:46:16,359 --> 00:46:13,549

signed some secret document that I links

1198

00:46:19,779 --> 00:46:16,369

him to supporting this stuff right right

1199

00:46:22,719 --> 00:46:19,789

system it becomes institutionalized it

1200

00:46:26,259 --> 00:46:22,729

becomes systemic where this is what you

1201
00:46:27,969 --> 00:46:26,269
do just to get to the next cookie crumb

1202
00:46:29,979 --> 00:46:27,979
that's on the ground you never see the

1203
00:46:31,089 --> 00:46:29,989
big picture there's very few people that

1204
00:46:33,069 --> 00:46:31,099
see the big picture

1205
00:46:35,109 --> 00:46:33,079
you know here's what I was gonna bring

1206
00:46:37,870 --> 00:46:35,119
back one last point in and appreciate

1207
00:46:40,029 --> 00:46:37,880
your your openness of awesome discussion

1208
00:46:42,039 --> 00:46:40,039
dialogue here but I do have to mention

1209
00:46:44,979 --> 00:46:42,049
this guy because he's just a pain in the

1210
00:46:49,089 --> 00:46:44,989
butt could you talk a little bit about

1211
00:46:51,640 --> 00:46:49,099
Jerry calling oh right I repeat some of

1212
00:46:53,529 --> 00:46:51,650
the gibberish that he's posted and I say

1213
00:46:55,359 --> 00:46:53,539

gibberish because the stuff he said

1214

00:46:56,910 --> 00:46:55,369

about me is totally baseless I don't

1215

00:46:59,679 --> 00:46:56,920

even have to go into it because any

1216

00:47:01,209 --> 00:46:59,689

fair-minded person can just listen to

1217

00:47:03,699 --> 00:47:01,219

the interview and the follow-up

1218

00:47:06,910 --> 00:47:03,709

interview that I did with him it's

1219

00:47:08,259 --> 00:47:06,920

obvious anyone will see it but let me

1220

00:47:10,539 --> 00:47:08,269

back up for a minute you know for folks

1221

00:47:13,539 --> 00:47:10,549

who don't know dr. Jerry Coyne from the

1222

00:47:15,489 --> 00:47:13,549

University of Chicago is this I got to

1223

00:47:18,729 --> 00:47:15,499

say he's an over-the-top atheist who

1224

00:47:22,239 --> 00:47:18,739

loves getting into these obscene filled

1225

00:47:24,390 --> 00:47:22,249

rants about religion and he's supposed

1226

00:47:28,479 --> 00:47:24,400

to be somewhat of an expert on

1227

00:47:32,650 --> 00:47:28,489

evolutionary theory in Darwin so I just

1228

00:47:35,559 --> 00:47:32,660

have to throw this in there because my

1229

00:47:37,779 --> 00:47:35,569

show right and as he says it was quite

1230

00:47:39,309 --> 00:47:37,789

contentious but anyone who knows this

1231

00:47:42,339 --> 00:47:39,319

guy knows that that's the way he loves

1232

00:47:45,400 --> 00:47:42,349

it you know like oh man it was so

1233

00:47:47,949 --> 00:47:45,410

content that is his game all the way so

1234

00:47:50,349 --> 00:47:47,959

one of the questions I was able to get

1235

00:47:52,269 --> 00:47:50,359

through to him and it has to do with the

1236

00:47:53,870 --> 00:47:52,279

history of the theory of evolution and

1237

00:47:56,990 --> 00:47:53,880

the relationship between

1238

00:47:58,609 --> 00:47:57,000

Charles Darwin yes an Alfred Russel

1239

00:48:01,039 --> 00:47:58,619

Wallace which anyone who knows this

1240

00:48:04,910 --> 00:48:01,049

history is a fascinating little story so

1241

00:48:07,970 --> 00:48:04,920

in particular jerry was emphatic about

1242

00:48:11,539 --> 00:48:07,980

claiming Alfred Russel Wallace never

1243

00:48:14,630 --> 00:48:11,549

connected biogeography to evolution he

1244

00:48:17,630 --> 00:48:14,640

this was actually his quote Wallace did

1245

00:48:20,180 --> 00:48:17,640

not use biogeography as evidence of

1246

00:48:21,980 --> 00:48:20,190

evolution I mean never

1247

00:48:24,079 --> 00:48:21,990

so he's emphatic about this point he

1248

00:48:26,420 --> 00:48:24,089

went on and on about it and of course

1249

00:48:28,370 --> 00:48:26,430

it's just anyone I don't even know this

1250

00:48:30,920 --> 00:48:28,380

stuff Dave and this is not this is so

1251

00:48:33,109 --> 00:48:30,930

outside of my field but I knew this I

1252

00:48:37,160 --> 00:48:33,119

know it was a completely absurd thing to

1253

00:48:38,960 --> 00:48:37,170

say so I mean I kind of had in the back

1254

00:48:42,829 --> 00:48:38,970

of my head that Wallace was considered

1255

00:48:45,529 --> 00:48:42,839

the fire the father of biogeography so I

1256

00:48:47,599 --> 00:48:45,539

interviewed professor Michael Flannery

1257

00:48:50,690 --> 00:48:47,609

who's an author he author days a

1258

00:48:51,890 --> 00:48:50,700

biographer of Wallace wrote a book about

1259

00:48:54,730 --> 00:48:51,900

him that I think it's called a

1260

00:48:58,249 --> 00:48:54,740

rediscovered life and I mean he just

1261

00:49:02,690 --> 00:48:58,259

exposes coin for the loudmouth ignoramus

1262

00:49:04,759 --> 00:49:02,700

that he is and it's game over if anyone

1263

00:49:08,710 --> 00:49:04,769

just listens or does just a basic search

1264

00:49:11,059 --> 00:49:08,720

on it so this is the kind of scientific

1265

00:49:13,670 --> 00:49:11,069

establishment the loony fringe of it

1266

00:49:15,200 --> 00:49:13,680

that I say is the tip of the spear that

1267

00:49:18,380 --> 00:49:15,210

really they let these people run out

1268

00:49:21,259 --> 00:49:18,390

there because it kind of creates stirs

1269

00:49:22,940 --> 00:49:21,269

up all this stuff that then people just

1270

00:49:24,740 --> 00:49:22,950

turn the other way because it's like oh

1271

00:49:26,960 --> 00:49:24,750

gosh I didn't want to get into that it's

1272

00:49:28,579 --> 00:49:26,970

another debate I want there must be two

1273

00:49:31,339 --> 00:49:28,589

sides to it we can never get to the

1274

00:49:33,859 --> 00:49:31,349

bottom of it and again I think as

1275

00:49:36,829 --> 00:49:33,869

evidenced by all your work that's a good

1276

00:49:38,480 --> 00:49:36,839

strategy to obscure the truth I'm sure

1277

00:49:39,980 --> 00:49:38,490

you've run into that with cults huh cuz

1278

00:49:42,049 --> 00:49:39,990

I've seen it a little bit you know if

1279

00:49:44,480 --> 00:49:42,059

they can put it's like a Scientology you

1280

00:49:46,910 --> 00:49:44,490

know if they can just kind of muddy the

1281

00:49:49,009 --> 00:49:46,920

waters a little bit and kind of throw

1282

00:49:51,079 --> 00:49:49,019

this out there and that out there they

1283

00:49:52,970 --> 00:49:51,089

can get most people to just drive by and

1284

00:49:55,309 --> 00:49:52,980

say well it's just another fight don't

1285

00:49:57,289 --> 00:49:55,319

worry about it but the good news because

1286

00:49:59,329 --> 00:49:57,299

I did see the follow-up study I did see

1287

00:50:02,089 --> 00:49:59,339

you tag them on that because I did see

1288

00:50:04,339 --> 00:50:02,099

the other interview and the good news is

1289

00:50:07,000 --> 00:50:04,349

that you got him on it do you understand

1290

00:50:09,040 --> 00:50:07,010

i allowing him to speak like that

1291

00:50:11,440 --> 00:50:09,050

is that you now have evidence where you

1292

00:50:13,780 --> 00:50:11,450

can say it makes no dent in the

1293

00:50:16,150 --> 00:50:13,790

machinery it marches on

1294

00:50:17,830 --> 00:50:16,160

well yes no you know you say that but I

1295

00:50:19,300 --> 00:50:17,840

kinda have a feeling it doesn't I think

1296

00:50:21,100 --> 00:50:19,310

for instance because in light of the

1297

00:50:23,050 --> 00:50:21,110

internet and so many different sources

1298

00:50:24,700 --> 00:50:23,060

of information is you know you have a

1299

00:50:26,710 --> 00:50:24,710

lot of fans you have a lot of people

1300

00:50:28,900 --> 00:50:26,720

that believe the position you've taken

1301

00:50:31,030 --> 00:50:28,910

so I have a feeling that the discussion

1302

00:50:33,100 --> 00:50:31,040

is opened up more for instance I'll give

1303

00:50:35,650 --> 00:50:33,110

you one example to look from a skeptical

1304

00:50:37,870 --> 00:50:35,660

textbook if the skeptical textbook is

1305

00:50:38,980 --> 00:50:37,880

called how to think about weird things I

1306

00:50:40,210 --> 00:50:38,990

don't know if you ever seen that by

1307

00:50:42,850 --> 00:50:40,220

Michael Sherman it's a different book

1308

00:50:45,040 --> 00:50:42,860

and at the very end of it you didn't

1309

00:50:46,180 --> 00:50:45,050

like this it's it makes the argument at

1310

00:50:49,680 --> 00:50:46,190

the very end of the book it makes an

1311

00:50:52,060 --> 00:50:49,690

argument that the ganzfeld experiments

1312

00:50:54,220 --> 00:50:52,070

have actually have evidence to support

1313

00:50:56,290 --> 00:50:54,230

them and this isn't this I'll give you

1314

00:51:02,800 --> 00:50:56,300

just read you the quote it's Theodore

1315

00:51:05,430 --> 00:51:02,810

Scheck s CH IC K and this is a textbook

1316

00:51:07,990 --> 00:51:05,440

that's used across the country in

1317

00:51:09,430 --> 00:51:08,000

critical thinking classes and what's

1318

00:51:11,890 --> 00:51:09,440

really quite interesting about it is

1319

00:51:13,900 --> 00:51:11,900

that he actually admits that the

1320

00:51:15,040 --> 00:51:13,910

ganzfeld experiments have some

1321

00:51:16,390 --> 00:51:15,050

evansville let's see if I can get the

1322

00:51:16,690 --> 00:51:16,400

exact quote free so it'll sound like an

1323

00:51:19,930 --> 00:51:16,700

idiot

1324

00:51:21,220 --> 00:51:19,940

here it goes the gans fat oh here it

1325

00:51:23,560 --> 00:51:21,230

goes I'll just who said Stokes has

1326

00:51:25,210 --> 00:51:23,570

calculated that only 62 unreported

1327

00:51:27,910 --> 00:51:25,220

studies at below the chance level are

1328

00:51:30,250 --> 00:51:27,920

needed to nullify original results and

1329

00:51:32,860 --> 00:51:30,260

that numbers a non-static a the ganzfeld

1330

00:51:35,890 --> 00:51:32,870

procedure remains the most promising way

1331

00:51:37,450 --> 00:51:35,900

to demonstrate the existence of SCI BAM

1332

00:51:39,250 --> 00:51:37,460

another well respected psychologists

1333

00:51:42,850 --> 00:51:39,260

remain convinced that these studies

1334

00:51:46,030 --> 00:51:42,860

identify an exception that has not yet

1335

00:51:47,320 --> 00:51:46,040

been explained this is that's that's a

1336

00:51:49,780 --> 00:51:47,330

good that's a positive sign

1337

00:51:51,970 --> 00:51:49,790

they're basically opening up that there

1338

00:51:55,110 --> 00:51:51,980

is there is a great scientific study out

1339

00:51:58,180 --> 00:51:55,120

there that might you know survive

1340

00:52:02,740 --> 00:51:58,190

scepticism might survive god forbid

1341

00:52:05,740 --> 00:52:02,750

amazing Randi oh my oh my

1342

00:52:07,060 --> 00:52:05,750

well I'll tell you what let me ask you

1343

00:52:10,330 --> 00:52:07,070

this final question so were you

1344

00:52:12,970 --> 00:52:10,340

sandbagged here not at all you know Alex

1345

00:52:15,580 --> 00:52:12,980

the minute I found out that you were

1346

00:52:18,460 --> 00:52:15,590

from Del Mar I knew you were my kind of

1347

00:52:20,059 --> 00:52:18,470

guy hey you know I do have to mention

1348

00:52:23,239 --> 00:52:20,069

this sandbagging thing because it's

1349

00:52:25,249 --> 00:52:23,249

kind of a joke for me now you know it's

1350

00:52:26,719 --> 00:52:25,259

become a euphemism for a skeptic or

1351
00:52:29,239 --> 00:52:26,729
atheist who got asked some tough

1352
00:52:31,489 --> 00:52:29,249
questions and couldn't you know answer

1353
00:52:33,229 --> 00:52:31,499
them so that's why I throw that all the

1354
00:52:35,539 --> 00:52:33,239
time I mean I'm not even title this that

1355
00:52:37,789 --> 00:52:35,549
you know dr. David Lane wasn't

1356
00:52:39,739 --> 00:52:37,799
sandbagged by questions because it's

1357
00:52:40,849 --> 00:52:39,749
it's just ridiculous you know for these

1358
00:52:44,329 --> 00:52:40,859
Red Bull to claim that they were

1359
00:52:46,279 --> 00:52:44,339
sandbagged so Dave it's been a great

1360
00:52:48,709 --> 00:52:46,289
pleasure a great day and I wanted to

1361
00:52:53,180 --> 00:52:48,719
compliment you in this sense you've made

1362
00:52:55,789 --> 00:52:53,190
me rethink you make me think differently

1363
00:52:57,499 --> 00:52:55,799

and that's a fantastic thing so you know

1364

00:52:59,269 --> 00:52:57,509

be a skeptic of the skeptics because the

1365

00:53:01,339 --> 00:52:59,279

skeptics need it tell us a little bit

1366

00:53:03,920 --> 00:53:01,349

about what's coming up for you what are

1367

00:53:07,579 --> 00:53:03,930

you doing any you know kind of exciting

1368

00:53:09,439 --> 00:53:07,589

news I got a really nice invitation from

1369

00:53:11,630 --> 00:53:09,449

the dialogue educational institute in

1370

00:53:12,920 --> 00:53:11,640

Agra India where they want to pick I

1371

00:53:15,229 --> 00:53:12,930

can't believe this they must be going

1372

00:53:18,349 --> 00:53:15,239

lowball they want to pay my way to India

1373

00:53:20,719 --> 00:53:18,359

and have me get be a keynote speaker on

1374

00:53:22,430 --> 00:53:20,729

a conference on consciousness well you

1375

00:53:24,439 --> 00:53:22,440

know consciousness and materialism and

1376

00:53:26,509 --> 00:53:24,449

these people I think they even had Roger

1377

00:53:28,670 --> 00:53:26,519

Penrose there they have a Nobel Prize

1378

00:53:30,109 --> 00:53:28,680

winner who worked on the Kobe experiment

1379

00:53:32,569 --> 00:53:30,119

coming out so that's coming up in

1380

00:53:34,430 --> 00:53:32,579

November so I'm really excited to try to

1381

00:53:36,829 --> 00:53:34,440

come up with some kind of interesting

1382

00:53:38,749 --> 00:53:36,839

film and book related to this debate

1383

00:53:40,489 --> 00:53:38,759

about like what you're doing about

1384

00:53:42,680 --> 00:53:40,499

consciousness it cannot be reduced to

1385

00:53:44,029 --> 00:53:42,690

you know to just neurons or is it

1386

00:53:46,279 --> 00:53:44,039

something transcendent to it

1387

00:53:48,920 --> 00:53:46,289

so it's gonna be kind of fun awesome

1388

00:53:51,469 --> 00:53:48,930

well I hope people do check out the

1389

00:53:53,239 --> 00:53:51,479

neural surfer and also if they just

1390

00:53:55,789 --> 00:53:53,249

google your name they can find a lot of

1391

00:53:57,109 --> 00:53:55,799

your really interesting essays I do have

1392

00:53:59,749 --> 00:53:57,119

to commend you here they're well written

1393

00:54:00,859 --> 00:53:59,759

and well produced for the web you also

1394

00:54:03,019 --> 00:54:00,869

have some kind of interesting videos

1395

00:54:05,689 --> 00:54:03,029

that you sent me as well so there's a

1396

00:54:09,140 --> 00:54:05,699

lot there for people to check out and

1397

00:54:11,269 --> 00:54:09,150

explore and I hope they do dr. Lane it's

1398

00:54:13,549 --> 00:54:11,279

been great having on skeptic oh thanks

1399

00:54:15,620 --> 00:54:13,559

again hey thanks I really appreciate it

1400

00:54:17,509 --> 00:54:15,630

was a wonderful interview thanks again

1401
00:54:19,549 --> 00:54:17,519
to dr. David Lane for joining me today

1402
00:54:21,949 --> 00:54:19,559
on skeptic oh I'm gonna provide a link

1403
00:54:24,349 --> 00:54:21,959
in the show notes to dr. lanes original

1404
00:54:26,329 --> 00:54:24,359
essay and his follow-up essay that he

1405
00:54:27,799 --> 00:54:26,339
just recently published check those out

1406
00:54:29,839 --> 00:54:27,809
I think you'll find those interesting

1407
00:54:31,579 --> 00:54:29,849
and I want to tee up a question from

1408
00:54:32,660 --> 00:54:31,589
this interview and it's a little bit

1409
00:54:33,799 --> 00:54:32,670
different from the way that I normally

1410
00:54:35,989 --> 00:54:33,809
do these in

1411
00:54:39,309 --> 00:54:35,999
it's a personal question and that is

1412
00:54:43,400 --> 00:54:39,319
what does it take for you to change your

1413
00:54:44,989 --> 00:54:43,410

position to let go of a belief and if

1414

00:54:47,269 --> 00:54:44,999

you think back and the times in your

1415

00:54:49,219 --> 00:54:47,279

life where you really did have a strong

1416

00:54:51,769 --> 00:54:49,229

belief about particularly about

1417

00:54:54,109 --> 00:54:51,779

something science related or the way the

1418

00:54:58,130 --> 00:54:54,119

world works related you know business

1419

00:55:01,400 --> 00:54:58,140

politics social issues whatever you had

1420

00:55:03,769 --> 00:55:01,410

a belief and it changed for you what was

1421

00:55:05,809 --> 00:55:03,779

that process like what did it take what

1422

00:55:08,120 --> 00:55:05,819

was effective in helping you make the

1423

00:55:09,890 --> 00:55:08,130

change and how did you feel after you

1424

00:55:12,679 --> 00:55:09,900

made that change and have you maybe

1425

00:55:14,809 --> 00:55:12,689

changed back so any kind of personal

1426

00:55:16,759 --> 00:55:14,819

accounts about that I think would be

1427

00:55:19,699 --> 00:55:16,769

interesting and I'll be glad to share

1428

00:55:21,589 --> 00:55:19,709

some of my own as well of course the

1429

00:55:24,109 --> 00:55:21,599

place to do this is at the skeptic o

1430

00:55:26,179 --> 00:55:24,119

forum which has been quite temperamental

1431

00:55:29,449 --> 00:55:26,189

lately as I'm still trying to work out

1432

00:55:31,069 --> 00:55:29,459

some technical problems with system

1433

00:55:33,199 --> 00:55:31,079

hosting and the like getting a lot of

1434

00:55:36,410 --> 00:55:33,209

good education and that from some of my

1435

00:55:38,539 --> 00:55:36,420

consultants but hopefully the skeptical

1436

00:55:40,489 --> 00:55:38,549

forum will be up you can also leave a

1437

00:55:45,679 --> 00:55:40,499

comment right there at the sceptical

1438

00:55:47,419 --> 00:55:45,689

website at ske p tik o dot-com and from

1439

00:55:49,189 --> 00:55:47,429

there you can click on over the forum or

1440

00:55:50,929 --> 00:55:49,199

leave the comment right there email me

1441

00:55:53,989 --> 00:55:50,939

Facebook me all those things are

1442

00:55:56,449 --> 00:55:53,999

available as our links to all our over

1443

00:55:58,880 --> 00:55:56,459

two hundred previous shows of skeptical

1444

00:56:01,459 --> 00:55:58,890

which you can subscribe to through

1445

00:56:03,739 --> 00:56:01,469

iTunes or download directly from the

1446

00:56:05,599 --> 00:56:03,749

website so that's going to do it for

1447

00:56:07,699 --> 00:56:05,609

this episode number of interesting shows

1448

00:56:10,429 --> 00:56:07,709

coming up a lot of things going on hope

1449

00:56:12,589 --> 00:56:10,439

I can get it all out to you in a timely

1450

00:56:14,169 --> 00:56:12,599

fashion hope you're enjoying it hope

1451

00:56:17,299 --> 00:56:14,179

you're sharing it with your friends

1452

00:56:19,219 --> 00:56:17,309

colleagues with the world and there's

1453

00:56:20,959 --> 00:56:19,229

nothing more gratifying than hearing

1454

00:56:23,569 --> 00:56:20,969

about your experience with the show in

1455

00:56:26,719 --> 00:56:23,579

hearing your desire to share it with